



Historic Heritage Evaluation

Butler House (Former)

3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera



Prepared by The Heritage Studio Limited on behalf of Auckland Council Heritage Unit

October 2018

Final

Historic Heritage Evaluation

Butler House (Former), 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera

Prepared by The Heritage Studio Limited on behalf of Auckland Council Heritage Unit

October 2018

Cover image: Principal elevation of Butler House (Former), viewed from the northwest (The Heritage Studio Ltd. (THS) 2018).

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this document is to consider the former Butler House, 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera against the criteria for evaluation of historic heritage in the Auckland Unitary Plan (**AUP**).

The document has been prepared by The Heritage Studio Ltd. on the specific instructions of Auckland Council's Heritage Unit. It is solely for the use of Auckland Council for the purpose it is intended in accordance with the agreed scope of work.

2.0 Identification

Site address	3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera, Auckland 1051		
Legal description and Certificate of Title (CT) identifiers	Lot 39 DP 21896, 1/8 SH Lot 53 DP 21896 (Site) Flat 1 DP 145900, 1/2 SH Lot 39 DP 21896, 1/16 SH Lot 53 DP 21896 (Building)		
NZTM grid reference	NZTM: X coordinate 1759491.18 and Y coordinate 5916252.70 ¹		
Ownership	Valerie Mary Muir		
Auckland Unitary Plan zoning	Residential - Terrace Housing and Apartment Buildings		
Existing scheduled item(s)	None		
Additional controls	Control: Macroinvertebrate Community Index		
Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga (HNZPT) listing details	None		
Pre-1900 site (HNZPT Act 2014 Section 6)	Unknown. Whilst the site formed part of an extensive estate in the nineteenth century, the archaeological values of the place are not currently known.		
CHI reference(s)	None		
NZAA site record number(s)	None		

3.0 Constraints

This evaluation is based on the information available at the time of the assessment. Due to the timeframe presented, historical and contextual research for the evaluation was undertaken to an extent that enables the place to be evaluated against the criteria but is not exhaustive. It is important to note that additional research may yield new information about the place.

¹ These coordinates were captured from the centre of the subject building.

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

A site visit was conducted on 18 July 2018, during which time access onto the property and within the building was made.

This evaluation does not include an assessment of archaeological values or an assessment of the importance of the place to Mana Whenua. Furthermore, this evaluation does not include a structural assessment or condition report; any comments on the structural integrity or the condition of the building are based on visual observations only.

Whilst every effort has been made to gain copyright permissions for the use of images in this document, a number of permissions have yet to be obtained.

4.0 Historical summary

Refer to **Appendix 1** and **Appendix 2** for a more comprehensive, fully referenced and illustrated historical background and supporting historical and architectural information.

The former Butler House was established in south Remuera on land that once formed part of the Dilworth Estate, an extensive landholding acquired and augmented in the 1840s by one of area's first European farmers, James Dilworth. With a long-established love of education and no heir, he bequeathed the bulk of his estate to the Dilworth Ulster Institute Trust, which was instructed to set up an institute (or school) to house and educate boys who lived in straitened circumstances. By the end of 1905, Dilworth's homestead had been adapted to provide temporary classrooms and accommodation for the new school.

Between 1904 and the 1920s, other portions of the Dilworth estate were progressively subdivided and leased by the Dilworth Trust Board. The grand residences, which had become characteristic of Remuera's landscape, were accompanied by simple bungalow-style houses and Arts and Crafts-inspired residences. One such subdivision was the Remuera Township Extension No. 2. Set out in 1907 for the Dilworth Trust Board, the subdivision captured land between Remuera Road (north), Great South Road (south) and Market Road (west) and saw the formation of Omahu, Dromorne, Lillington and Pine (now Platina) roads over the following two decades.

In 1928, over eight acres of land to the south of the Remuera Township Extension No. 2 (between Great South Road and the railway line) was subdivided. Forming part of Allotment 1, Section 12, the subdivision, which represented the last portion of the Dilworth estate to be subdivided, comprised 32 lots and resulted in the creation of Otahuri Crescent. In 1930, Lot 39 of the subdivision was leased for a term of 21 years to Henry ('Harry') James Butler, an Auckland-based solicitor and partner in the legal firm of Butler White & Hanna. The company, which operated extensively in local government law, later merged with two other practices to become Simpson Grierson, one of New Zealand's largest law firms.

Following the lease of Lot 39 on Otahuri Crescent, Butler commissioned the practice of well-known architect, Llewellyn (Llew) S. Piper – 'Piper and Brooker' – to design a residence for him and his family. Drawn up in 1931, 'Butler House' was designed as a single-storey brick residence that followed a roughly linear plan with two principal projecting bays and asymmetrical porch. Accommodation comprised a hall, living room, dining room, kitchen, study, two bedrooms, sleeping porch, bathroom and laundry, and key features included Australian jarrah floors, timber wall panelling, leaded-light internal doors and a decorative fireplace. The architects also designed a modest timber garage with a concrete base and hipped tile roof that was erected in the southern corner of the site.

By the time Butler House was built in the early-1930s, the Arts and Crafts movement had long inspired the design of Remuera homes and had begun to be expressed in the design of more modest dwellings, like the subject building. The 1930s also marked a period of change in Remuera's (and Auckland's) built form. While the Crown began to purchase pockets of Remuera land for the construction of state houses, a new architectural language was emerging. In Otahuri Crescent, this was visible in the transition from the Arts and Crafts/English Cottage Revival and Spanish Mission-inspired dwellings to the modernist house.

Although the design of Butler House, with its brick and tile construction, steep gables and Tudoresque porch, hinted at the Arts and Crafts movement, its linear plan, horizontal emphasis and restrained detailing created a more modern appearance – bridging the gap between the stylistic influences of previous decades and a more progressive approach to design. The architect's use of a less conventional layout and incorporation of bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms provided a flexibility of living that hinted at the open-plan concept that did not become popular until after the Second World War. Such 'modern' propensities may have been the reason Butler House featured in the debut issue of 'Building Today' in 1936 (five years after its design). The article was entitled '*A Portfolio of Modern New Zealand Homes*'.

For over three decades, Henry James Butler and his wife, Esme occupied Butler House. A year after Henry's death in 1967, the property was transferred to the Trustees, Executors and Agency Company of New Zealand Limited. The residence was subsequently occupied by a Mrs Gearon. In 1979, the lease was transferred to Auckland Museum curator, Brian Donald Muir and teacher, Valerie May Muir, both of whom were involved in the establishment of the Waiuku Museum and wrote books about the area's history. During the 1980s, the Muirs installed a swimming pool (since removed), extended the library into the washhouse and replaced the dining room casement windows with French doors. The casement windows were later installed in the library.

In 1991, Valerie Muir, who had become the property's sole leaseholder two years earlier, acquired the freehold from the Dilworth Trust. The land was subsequently cross-leased, consisting of Flat 1 and Flat 2. Flat 1 comprised the largest part of the original site, which included the former Butler House, while Flat 2 incorporated the southwestern portion of the site, upon which a new two-storey house was constructed. The original garage became part of Flat 2 and, in 1995, a 'new' garage was relocated from Torbay and positioned in the northeastern corner of Flat 1. Around this time, a cross-lease was established at the property.

Further changes were carried out to the residence during the 1990s and 2000s. These included the installation of French doors in the main bedroom, which led out onto a newly constructed deck, and the slight repositioning of the kitchen doorway along the hallway. In 2006, a modest conservatory was added to the rear elevation to enlarge the kitchen and create an informal dining space. Other works involved the utilisation of the library as a further bedroom and the creation of an en-suite in part of the original washhouse. In c.2007, a ventilation system was added.

The subject building has been occupied by Mrs Valerie Muir for almost 40 years and remains in residential use as a single home (2018).

5.0 Physical description

A site visit was undertaken on 18 July 2018. Refer to **Appendix 2.2** for architectural drawings and **Appendix 3** for a full photographic record.

5.1 Location, context and site

The former Butler House is located in Remuera, one of Auckland's oldest and most affluent residential suburbs. Remuera is situated approximately six kilometres to the southeast of Auckland's CBD and is bisected by Remuera Road, a main thoroughfare that extends eastwards along the ridgeline from Newmarket to Meadowbank. The land to the north and south of the main road gradually slopes to the Orakei Basin and Hobson Bay, and Great South Road respectively.



Figure 1: Map showing the subject site (circled) within Remuera, and the location of the suburb within the broader region (inset) (Auckland Council GeoMaps).

The subject site is situated close to the suburb's southern boundary, between State Highway 1 and the main thoroughfare of Great South Road. Located on Otahuri Crescent, a flattened U-shaped residential street with dual access off Great South Road, the corner site measures approximately 744m² and is occupied by the subject building (Butler House), a modern two-storey townhouse and two garages (including the original structure that now serves the townhouse). The property is surrounded by residences that principally date from the 1930s and 1940s with pockets of recent infill or replacement development.

The former Butler House occupies the larger, northern portion of the site, which is bordered by timber close-boarded fencing and hedging, and comprises a mixture of mature trees, low-level planting and areas of lawn. The building is orientated to the northwest and is set back slightly from the pavement. A pair of metal gates in the northwestern boundary serves as the site's main entry and lead to the house via a concrete path. A weatherboard double garage is situated in the property's northeastern corner. Hard surfacing and pathways within the property are made up of

a mixture of concrete and paving slabs that connect the house with the garden via timber decks and a tiled patio.



Figure 2: Aerial image showing the location of the subject site – 3 Otahuri Crescent – within its south Remuera context. The CT boundary captures the subject building, a neighbouring modern residence, ancillary structures and a right of way (Auckland Council GeoMaps).



Figure 3: Aerial image showing the former Butler House located centrally on the site addressed 3 Otahuri Crescent (Auckland Council GeoMaps).

5.2 Exterior

The former Butler House is a single-storey residence, built over a roughly linear plan with two principal bays and a secondary bay to the rear. The building is of brick construction, laid predominantly in stretcher bond, with a hipped and gabled roof covered in Marseilles tiles and a plain brick external chimney stack that extends from the southwest elevation. A gabled porch is asymmetrically situated on the principal (northeast) elevation. Accessed by a set of brick steps, the porch is of timber-frame construction with roughcast panels, board and batten and tongue and groove interior

and a built-in bench. Modern timber decks are positioned on the northeast and southeast elevations, the latter leading to a weatherboard 'conservatory' extension.



Figure 4: The main (northeast) elevation of the former Butler House, viewed from the street. Note its distinctive gables and asymmetrical front porch.



Figure 5: Side (northeast) elevation showing the sleeping porch (left), deck and French doors that lead to the master bedroom.

Figure 6: Part rear (southeast) showing the new conservatory and deck (far left) and part side (northeast) elevation.

Characterised by its steep-pitched gables and asymmetrical frontage, the design of the building hints at the Arts and Crafts and, to a lesser degree, English Cottage styles. This is reinforced by the front porch's Tudor surface treatment and detailing and in elements such as the gently outward-sloping eaves and stepped brick brackets. Another distinctive feature is the deep copper band set above the building's principal bay window.

Fenestration throughout the building comprises a mixture of large timber casement windows with leaded top-lights, plain timber casements and a set of leaded-light casements, each of which are set in openings with brick sills. Timber French doors feature on the northeast and southwest elevations, with a further set providing access into the conservatory. The main entrance comprises a solid timber-panelled door framed by a plain timber architrave and threshold, with decorative ironmongery and Tudor-arch detailing (a treatment that continues throughout the interior). A narrow ventilation grille is situated in the apex of each of the building's principal gables.



Figure 7: One of the principal gables, featuring a gently outward sloping roof, stepped brick eaves brackets and ventilation grille (THS, 2018).



Figure 8: Bay window featuring casement units with leaded top-lights and a distinctive copper band (THS, 2018).



Figure 9: Sleeping porch on the side (northeast) elevation, with plain timber casement windows and the same stepped brick eaves detail (THS, 2018).

Figure 10: Partially enclosed asymmetrical front porch with Tudoresque surface treatment and detailing. Brick steps lead to the tiled entry (THS, 2018).

Figure 11: Front entrance featuring a solid panelled timber door with Tudor arch detailing and decorative ironmongery (THS, 2018).

5.3 Interior

The original internal layout, fabric and features of the former Butler House are largely intact. The building's layout is centred around the hallway, which runs perpendicular to the principal entrance and provides access to each of the main rooms. A third bedroom and en-suite (formerly the study and laundry) is accessed via the dining room, whilst the sleeping porch is entered through the two original bedrooms. A small modern conservatory is situated at the rear of the kitchen. Although not shown in the original architectural drawings, a large opening with bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms (that appears original to the house) provides the flexibility of a more open-plan living arrangement.

A high degree of historic fabric and features remain. Australian jarrah floors exist throughout the house, apart from the bathroom, which retains its early 'basket-weave' tiles. Dark-stained box beams and battens crisscross the living room ceiling, while similarly arranged battens appear on the dining room and bedroom (the latter painted) ceilings. The hallway features a distinctive vaulted beam and batten ceiling and heavily panelled walls. The once dark-stained panelling, architraves, skirting and moulded dado rails are now painted white. Board and battens line the internal walls of the

sleeping porch whilst its partially sloping ceiling is covered in timber tongue and groove.

The house's only fireplace occupies a central position on the outer wall of the living room. Flanked by built-in timber shelves, it has a marble hearth and inlay panels framed by a timber moulding and surround. Many of the original internal timber doors remain, including bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms and those on the built-in linen cupboard and wardrobes. Each door is detailed with either a solid or leaded-light 'Tudor arch' panel and retains its original ironmongery. Those with a glazed panel also feature a decorative stained glass shield. A multi-glazed timber door and plastic shutter-style openings lead from the bedrooms into the sleeping porch. A less decorative panelled door provides access into the en-suite from the third bedroom/study.



Figure 12: View of the living room looking towards the dining room through the large opening, which creates a more open-plan concept to this part of the house. Note the beam and batten ceiling and Tudor-arch solid panelled and glazed doors (THS, 2018).



Figure 13: Looking northeast along the hallway (from the location of the front door) towards the bathroom and bedrooms. Note the hallway's distinctive vaulted beam and batten ceiling and heavily panelled walls (THS, 2018).







Figure 15: The main bedroom showing access through into the sleeping porch and two built-in wardrobes featuring the same Tudor-arch panel detailing and original ironmongery (THS, 2018).

5.4 Condition

Based on visual observations only, the former Butler House appears to be in very good condition.

5.5 Use

The building is currently (2018) in use as a single residence.

5.6 Summary of key features

- Principal building materials, including brick walls and Marseilles tile roof.
- The building's linear form and horizontal emphasis.
- Prominent principal gables with outward sloping eaves and stepped brick brackets.
- Tall, external brick chimney.
- Asymmetrical 'Tudoresque' porch, including integrated bench.
- All original timber fenestration, including bay window with copper band and panelled front door with ironmongery.
- The opening between the living and dining rooms with purpose-built and designed bi-fold doors.
- Original fabric such as the Australian jarrah wooden floors, beam and batten ceilings, distinctive hallway panelling and timber finishes (architraves, skirting boards).
- Fireplace and built-in shelves.
- All original internal doors (both solid and glazed) with Tudor-arch detail and ironmongery.
- Built-in cupboards.
- Originally designed garage (now forming part of the adjacent cross-lease).

6.0 Comparative analysis

Refer to **Appendix 2** and **Appendix 4** for further details and supporting information.

When considering the former Butler House in relation to other similar or related places, the most relevant comparisons are with other houses influenced by the Arts and Crafts (in the locality) or English Cottage styles in addition to other residences designed by Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker. The comparisons made are based on *known* places within Remuera and beyond and the level of research permitted within the project timeframe. It is therefore acknowledged that more targeted research leading to a broader comprehensive comparison with other heritage places within a more extensive geographic area may yield further information.

Architectural comparisons

During the early decades of the twentieth century, the Arts and Crafts-influenced house abounded in Remuera. Characterised by clarity of form and structure, steep-pitched roofs, asymmetry and craftsmanship, the Arts and Crafts residence represented a shift from the ornate Victorian and Edwardian villas to a simpler, less cluttered approach to domestic design and living. Initially adopted for the design of large-scale residences that reflected the status and prosperity of their owners, the style was adapted by architects to create a unique form of New Zealand (albeit British-derived) architecture.² Whilst some architects stayed true to the Arts and Crafts principles, others adopted an aesthetic more akin to the Garden City/Suburb movement, designing a scaled-down adaptation that became known as the English Cottage style. The 1930s saw the revival of the style, with distinguishing features such as asymmetrical gable roofs with shingle or 'Tudor' surface treatments. Variations of the design were developed with the help of pattern book designers, which enabled builders to reproduce the style for those of more modest means.

² Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 251; Peter Macky and Paul White, *Coolangatta A Homage*, Auckland, Livadia Publishers Limited, 2010, 47-73.

Built in 1931 as a single-storey residence, the former Butler House, with its steeppitched gables, asymmetry and built-in furniture, appears to have been influenced by the Arts and Crafts style that had become popular in the design of larger Remuera homes in previous decades. Its smaller scale and Tudor detailing also reference the English Cottage Revival style that emerged during the 1930s.

Despite these characteristics, when looking more closely at the former Butler House's plan, use of materials and detailed design, it is apparent that fundamental physical differences exist. In consideration of some of the more well-known Arts and Crafts residences in Remuera, many of which were built during the 1910s and 20s by architects such as Roy Binney, Gerald E. Jones, and Smith and Mullions, the former Butler House differs not only in age and scale but also in its use and application of materials. As a single-storey residence, it is of much smaller proportions than its predominantly two-storey predecessors, and with a material palette limited to brick and clay tiles, it lacks the variation of finish that comes with the use of shingle, weatherboard and/or stucco.

Differences are also apparent when comparing the former Butler House with English Cottage Revival houses, examples of which often formed part of larger 'estate' or group developments in the 1930s. Despite similarities in scale and the use (to varying degrees) of Tudor surface treatment, other aspects of their detailed design and materiality are quite different. In making such comparisons, it is clear that one of the key points of variance is their plan and form. With a form heavily influenced by the English Cottage style, these houses essentially followed a bungalow plan, whilst the subject building adopted a more elongated plan with references to more open-plan living.

In making such architectural comparisons, it is clear that whilst the design of the former Butler House was likely influenced by aspects of the long-established Arts and Crafts movement and, to a lesser degree, the English Cottage Revival style, its layout and conscious paring-back of its detailed design hints at a more 'modern' approach to domestic architecture.

Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker: Other residential projects

The former Butler House was designed by the architectural firm of Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker (also 'Piper and Brooker'), which operated for just under 10 years between 1928 and 1937. During this time, the practice was involved with a variety of commercial, public, ecclesiastical and residential projects and appeared to be influenced by a number of architectural styles. The firm's designs of a Catholic School in Hastings, Hawkes Bay and the Kings Theatre in Te Puke, for example, reveal Spanish Mission influences, whilst its design of the Berkley Theatre, Mission Bay has more of an Art Deco flavour. Towards the end of their partnership, Llew S. Piper designed the avant-garde extension to the Warkworth Town Hall, which has been regarded as an expression of progressive ideas and modernity.

In terms of the firm's residential portfolio, few details have been found to confirm the location and design of the projects. It is therefore difficult to ascertain how the former Butler House compares to other residences in their portfolio and whether it stands apart architecturally or shares similar physical qualities. Photographs of three residences designed by Piper and Brooker, one in Takapuna, one in Remuera and another in One Tree Hill, reveal that whilst some similarities can be seen in the use of projecting bays (in some instances), bay windows and plain external chimneys, their general form and materiality (specifically wall cladding) is quite different.

In looking more broadly at Piper's designs prior to, and following, his partnership with Brooker, it is apparent that his residential designs also vary. Architectural drawings

reveal that he sometimes provided several renderings of one house design to a client, hinting that he was not wedded to one particular style. It is unclear whether this demonstrates a response to varied client briefs or the evolution of his personal design approach. Many of his commercial, public and civic buildings, designed during the same decade as the former Butler House, however, appear to have been influenced by the Art Deco style, whilst some of his later, most well-known works, were designed in the new, modern architectural style.

When comparing the former Butler House to the other (limited number of) known residences designed by the firm of Piper and Brooker, and Llew S. Piper himself, it has become clear that they differ in plan, detailed design and materiality, indicating that there was less of a focus on establishing a recognisable style. It is therefore difficult to draw parallels in their overall design approach. In looking closely at the former Butler House, which on the face of it, appears to have been influenced by the Arts and Crafts style, the restraint in its detailing, unusual layout and attempts at a more open-plan layout suggests that Piper and Brooker was thinking more progressively about modern design and living.

7.0 Significance criteria

(a) Historical

The place reflects important or representative aspects of national, regional or local history, or is associated with an important event, person, group of people or idea or early period of settlement within the nation, region or locality.

Built in the early 1930s, the former Butler House is a tangible reminder of the changing social needs and attitudes towards suburban living and residential design during the Great Depression. At a time when few New Zealanders could afford a new architect-designed home, the place reflects the enduring influence of long-established architectural styles but with the restraint that was becoming both fashionable and economically necessary during this time. Despite the challenging financial times, the house was built with a detached garage, which demonstrates the rapid increase and perceived requirement of private automobile ownership in inter-war suburban Auckland.

The place is strongly associated with Auckland-based solicitor, Henry ('Harry') Butler, who commissioned and occupied the house for the its first three decades. Butler was a partner in the legal firm of Butler White & Hanna, which operated extensively in local government law and later merged with two other practices to become Simpson Grierson, one of New Zealand's largest law firms. Whilst Butler most likely played a role in the success and growth of Butler White & Hanna, he is one of the lesser known partners, which makes it difficult to fully establish the level of contribution he made and thereby the relative importance of his association with Butler House.

The place is of interest for its association with one of the final phases of the Dilworth estate's early twentieth century subdivisions, a pattern of development that, with its availability of land for lease and more modest homes, changed the face of the south Remuera's built landscape.

Overall, the former Butler House is considered to demonstrate some importance and interest for its historical associations and representative aspects of local history.

The place is of **moderate** historical value **locally**.

(b) Social

The place has a strong or special association with, or is held in high esteem by, a particular community or cultural group for its symbolic, spiritual, commemorative, traditional or other cultural value.

The former Butler House is not known to have a strong or special association with any community or cultural groups, to be a historical marker that the local community identifies with, or to be held in high public esteem. As such, the place is considered to have little social value at this time.

The place has little social value locally.

(c) Mana Whenua

The place has a strong or special association with, or is held in high esteem by Mana Whenua for its symbolic, spiritual, commemorative, traditional or other cultural value.

An assessment of the place's value to Mana Whenua has not been undertaken as part of this evaluation.

(d) Knowledge

The place has potential to provide knowledge through scientific or scholarly study or to contribute to an understanding of the cultural or natural history of the nation, region or locality.

As a largely intact example of early 1930s architecture, the former Butler House has the potential to provide knowledge about the functioning of the lives of middle-class families during this time. However, the place is unlikely to yield substantial information not already available from other places or sources. The place is therefore considered to have little knowledge value.

The place has little knowledge value locally.

(e) Technology

The place demonstrates technical accomplishment, innovation or achievement in its structure, construction, components or use of materials.

The former Butler House is not known to demonstrate a creative or technical accomplishment, innovation or achievement in its structure, construction, components or use of materials. As such, the place is considered to have no technology value.

The place has **no** technology value.

(f) Physical attributes

The place is a notable or representative example of a type, design or style, method of construction, craftsmanship or use of materials or the work of a notable architect, designer, engineer or builder.

The former Butler House has considerable physical attributes value within the locality for its well-executed design and craftsmanship and for retaining integrity of historic form, fabric and features (both externally and internally). Simple, yet cleverly displaying a sense of continuity from its exterior to its interior, the detailed design of the former Butler House is one of its most significant qualities. Influenced by the Arts and Crafts movement, and, to a lesser degree, the English Cottage Revival style, its design also hints at a more 'modern' take on domestic design, demonstrating the evolving architectural climate of the 1930s.

Having long inspired the design of Remuera homes, the Arts and Crafts movement was, by the 1930s, also being expressed in the design of more modest dwellings. Characterised by its steep-pitched gables, asymmetrical porch and built-in furniture, the former Butler House is of note for illustrating the ongoing adaptability of the style for less substantial homes, while its less conventional layout, horizontal emphasis and conscious paring back of its detailed design, highlights a slightly more progressive approach to residential architecture during that time. Of particular interest is the large opening with purpose-built and designed bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms that offered the layout an element of flexibility and open-plan living that did not become popular until after the Second World War.

The former Butler House was designed by the firm of notable architect Llew S. Piper and his partner L. E. Brooker. The Auckland-based practice operated from 1928 to 1937 and was responsible for the design of a variety of residential, commercial, community and ecclesiastical projects, most notably the avant-garde extension to the Warworth Town Hall (1937). Whilst Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker appear to have been one of the lesser known architectural partnerships during the late-1920s and 30s, Llew S. Piper went on to become one of the leading New Zealand-born architects practicing in the country during the mid-twentieth century. Although the design of the Butler House cannot be directly attributed to Piper himself, it is of interest as a notable and intact example of his residential work that reflects his early tendencies towards the 'modern' architecture for which he later became so well-known.

Overall, the place has **considerable** physical attributes value **locally**.

(g) Aesthetic

The place is notable or distinctive for its aesthetic, visual, or landmark qualities.

As a single-storey residence, partially screened by mature trees and located within a streetscape that comprises both single and two-storey buildings, the former Butler House is not considered a local landmark. However, its well-articulated principal elevation, simple design and (exterior and interior) features of note, contribute to its aesthetic quality and visual distinction within its immediate environs.

The place has **moderate** aesthetic value **locally**.

(h) Context

The place contributes to or is associated with a wider historical or cultural context, streetscape, townscape, landscape or setting.

Occupying its original site for over 80 years, the former Butler House has a longstanding association with its corner site. However, the subdivision and crosslease of the property and subsequent construction of the neighbouring townhouse has, to some extent, compromised its immediate context and has resulted in the visual, physical and functional separation of the principal residence from its original garage. As one of a number of houses constructed during the 1930s and 1940s on Otahuri Crescent, the place positively contributes to an architecturally diverse streetscape that illustrates the design preferences of the period and represents one of the last subdivisions of the Dilworth estate. Infill housing and redevelopment has nevertheless interrupted any sense of cohesion the group of buildings may have once had.

The place has little context value locally.

8.0 Statement of significance

Designed in 1931 by the firm of notable architect Llew S. Piper and his partner L. E. Brooker for Auckland solicitor, Harry Butler, the former Butler House is significant for its well-executed design and craftsmanship and for retaining integrity of historic from, fabric and features (both externally and internally). The place is also a tangible reminder of the changing social needs and attitudes towards suburban living and residential design during the Great Depression.

Influenced by the Arts and Crafts movement, and, to a lesser degree, the English Cottage Revival style, the design of the former Butler House also hints at a more 'modern' take on domestic design, demonstrating the evolving architectural climate of the 1930s. Characterised by its steep-pitched gables, asymmetrical porch and built-in furniture, the place is of note for illustrating the ongoing adaptability of the Arts and Crafts style for less substantial homes, while its less conventional layout, horizontal emphasis and conscious paring back of its detailed design, highlights a more progressive approach to residential architecture during that time. Of particular interest is the large opening with purpose-built and designed bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms that offered the layout an element of flexibility and open-plan living that did not become popular until after the Second World War. The building's well-articulated principal elevation, simple design and notable internal features, also contribute to its aesthetic quality and visual distinction within its immediate environs.

9.0 Extent of the place for scheduling

- The identified extent of place is the area that is integral to the function, meaning and relationships of the place.
- The original section (Lot 39, DP 21896) upon which the former Butler House was built was subdivided in the 1990s and a cross-lease established. The legibility of the original site layout has been compromised by the construction of a modern townhouse and the erection of boundary walls that have resulted in the appearance of two very independent sites. Whilst the historical connection between the principal house and its original garage is important, the visual, physical and functional separation between the two buildings has, to some

extent, weakened their relationship. For this reason, the incorporation of the entire parcel boundary for 3 Otahuri Crescent (refer to **Figure 16**) has been discounted.

- The recommended extent of place therefore encompasses the portion of 3 Otahuri Crescent that captures portion 'A' (Flat 1) of the cross-lease as shown in Appendix 1.2.3 (NA86C/220, DP 145900) and set out in Figure 16. This extent encompasses the former Butler House, including its highly intact interior, which is fundamental to its significance, and all land within the identified boundary.
- Exclusions include the relocated double garage that was relocated to the site in 1995. Although the location and low-level nature of the structure has a relatively neutral effect on the setting of the former Butler House, it does not actively contribute to the significance of the place.



Figure 16: Proposed extent of place for the former Butler House (purple hatch), partially outlined by the parcel boundary for 3 Otahuri Crescent (blue line) and showing garage exclusion (red hatch) (Auckland Council GeoMaps).

10.0 Recommendations

- Based on the preceding evaluation, the former Butler House, 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera is shown to demonstrate *considerable* physical attributes value, and *moderate* historical and aesthetic values within the locality.
- Whilst the former Butler House meets the 'considerable' threshold for only one of the evaluation criteria, the place, overall, is still deemed to be of **considerable** historic heritage significance within the **locality**. It therefore meets the threshold to be included as a **Category B** historic heritage place in the Schedule.
- The extent of place includes all that land set out in **Figure 16**.

Significance Criteria (A- H)	Value* (None, Little, Moderate, Considerable, Exceptional)	Context (Local, Regional, National, International)
A- Historical	Moderate	Local
B- Social	Little	Local
C- Mana Whenua	Not evaluated	Not evaluated
D- Knowledge	Little	Local
E- Technology	None	N/a
F- Physical Attributes	Considerable	Local
G- Aesthetic	Moderate	Local
H- Context	Little	Local

11.0 Table of Historic Heritage Values

*Levels of significance or value:

Exceptional: of outstanding importance and interest; retention of the identified value(s)/significance is essential.

Considerable: of great importance and interest; retention of the identified value(s)/significance is very important.

Moderate: of some importance and interest; retention of the identified value(s)/significance is desirable.

Little: of limited importance and interest.

NA/None: none identified

12.0 Overall significance

Place Name and/or Description	Butler House (Former) 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera
Category	В
Primary Feature	Principal residence (Butler House (Former))
Known Heritage Values	F
Extent of Place	Refer to planning maps (all that land shown in Figure 16)
Exclusions (within the extent of place)	Relocated garage

Additional Controls for Archaeological Sites or Features	
Place of Maori Interest or Significance	

Author:

The Heritage Studio Ltd. Carolyn O'Neil, Heritage Consultant

Date:

October 2018

Reviewer:

Auckland Council Megan Walker, Specialist Built Heritage - Policy

Date:

September 2018

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Historical background

- 1.1 Chronological summary
- 1.2 Deeds and Land Information New Zealand (LINZ) records
- 1.3 Historic maps, aerials and photographs
- 1.4 Biography: James Dilworth
- 1.5 Henry ('Harry') James Butler

Appendix 2: Architectural information

- 2.1 Architect | Architectural practice
- 2.2 Architectural drawings

Appendix 3: Photographic record

Appendix 4: Comparative analysis – supplementary information

Appendix 1: Historical background

The former Butler House was established in south Remuera on land that once formed part of the Dilworth Estate, an extensive landholding acquired and augmented in the 1840s by one of area's first European farmers – James Dilworth.

Early history: Tāmaki-makau-rau and Remuwera

Long before the arrival of European settlers, *Remuwera*³ and surrounding lands were a valued part of Tāmaki-makau-rau. Whilst Māori settlement on the isthmus is thought to have begun some centuries prior to 1400 AD, it was during this time of population increase that the tops of nearby volcanic cones were transformed into pā, and low-lying areas cultivated.⁴ The Remuwera (present-day Mt Hobson) cone, for example, was terraced for habitation, agriculture and defence.⁵ Tāmaki-makau-rau was generally divided into hapū territories, and with its wealth of volcanic cones, cultivated land, bush, and abundant food sources, the highly desirable isthmus inevitably attracted outside tribes, making it *"a melting pot of resident people and incomers alike"*.⁶

By 1700, Wai-o-Hua were the dominant group on the isthmus, occupying numerous pā including Remuwera⁷ and nearby Maunga-rāhiri⁸ (later Little Rangitoto in Upland Road) pā.⁹ However, inter-tribal friction and conflict led to their eventual downfall, and in 1750, they were faced with sustained attacks from Ngāti Whātua.¹⁰ Following Wai-o-Hua's defeat, other conflicts ensued between Ngāti Pāoa, the residents of the southeast of the isthmus, and Ngāti Whātua.¹¹ Following a few decades of relative peace and stability in Tāmaki-makau-rau, the acquisition of muskets by Ngā Puhi in 1820 completely unbalanced tribal power when they attacked Ngāti Whātua from the north, to devastating effect.¹² After the musket wars, inter-tribal relationships across the North Island were altered irrevocably and the traditional Māori way of life on Tāmaki-makau-rau began to change.¹³ By the time Europeans arrived, the isthmus was largely uninhabited.

First land purchases

In May 1840, prior to Governor William Hobson formally founding the settlement of Auckland and before the acquisition of Māori land by the Crown, a young John Logan Campbell visited the Waitematā with the intention of purchasing land from Ngāti Whātua. He was particularly captivated by the beauty of present-day Remuera, however, his attempt to acquire land on its northern slopes failed.¹⁴ Later that year, Ngāti Whātua leader, Te Kawau offered 3,000 acres of land to Governor Hobson for the establishment of the town of Auckland, and in 1841, the Crown acquired the Kohimarama Block, located to the east of Remuera, from Ngāti Pāoa.¹⁵

It was not until 1844, following a great feast held by Waikato iwi at Remuera, that Māori land in the area first became available. Purchased under Governor Robert FitzRoy's 10-shilling pre-emption waivers during 1844 and 1845, large blocks of Remuera land to

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

³ The Maori name, *Remuwera* came from two words: *remu* meaning hem or edge, and *wera* meaning burnt.

⁴ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, A Fine Prospect: A History or Remuera, Meadowbank and St Johns, Auckland, Random House, 2011, 21.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ R. C. J. Stone, *From Tamaki-Makau-Rau to Auckland,* Auckland, Auckland University press, 2002, 10.

⁷ Remuwera pa (Mt Hobson) was originally name Ohinerau (the place of Hinerau).

⁸ Maunga-rahiri pa (Little Rangitoto or Rangitoto-iti) was located atop a volcanic cone, near present-day Little Rangitoto Reserve at the lower end of Upland Road.

⁹ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 21-2.

¹⁰ Ibid., 22.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Ibid., 25.

 ¹³ Ibid., 21.
 ¹⁴ Ibid., 8 and 26.

¹⁵ Remuera Heritage, *Remuera Heritage Walk: St Aidans to Mount Hobson*, 2006.

the south of the newly established Tāmaki (later Remuera) Road were swiftly acquired by early settlers and investors.¹⁶

Between 1847 and 1855, the Crown had purchased the remaining Remuera land to the north of Tāmaki Road from Ngāti Whātua. The first public auction, in 1848, included the Te Tiki blocks (land between Newmarket and Bassett Road). Surveyed as Section 14, the land comprised four to six acre lots that sold well in excess of the reserve.¹⁷ Fierce competition resulted in high purchase prices, which continued during the subsequent public auctions that included the Ōhinerau blocks (1852-3) and those lots of the Pukapuka blocks (1855-6) not already set aside as native reserves. These areas were collectively surveyed as Section 16 and covered the majority of the northern slopes of present-day Remuera and part of Meadowbank.¹⁸

Early landowner: James Dilworth

Remuera land continued to be highly desirable and was eagerly purchased by settlers and speculators when it became available. The remarkable scenery and relatively close proximity to Auckland made Remuera an ideal location for Auckland's most prosperous residents. Successful merchants and businessmen, professionals, distinguished farmers and influential landowners all made Remuera home.¹⁹

James Dilworth (1815-1894) was one such individual.²⁰ Following his arrival in Auckland in 1841, the Ulsterman established himself as a prominent public figure and shrewd farmer. He first acquired land in Remuera during the mid-1840s, receiving a Crown grant of 160 acres between Mount Hobson and Mount St John.²¹ By the end of the decade, Dilworth had augmented his property by purchasing neighbouring land and was successfully managing the extensive holding, which was used initially for growing wheat and later for dairy and sheep farming. By the early 1850s, almost the entire farm, including ten acres of market gardens, was leased. The remaining 23-acre portion of land situated to the southwest of and adjacent to Great South Road was utilised as Dilworth's homestead farm. It was there that he constructed his grand farmhouse where he lived with his wife Isabella (nee. Hall), grew grass for hay and raised livestock.²²



Figure 17: Panoramic view looking west from Mount Hobson showing the slope of Mount St John (left). Great South Road (foreground) and the Dilworth residence (centre) (James D. Richardson. Sir George Grey Special Collections, Auckland Libraries, 4-869).

- ¹⁸ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 38 and 54; Winifred Macdonald, 1983, 6.
- ¹⁹ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 8-9 and 46.
- ²⁰ Refer to **Appendix 1.4** for a biography on James Dilworth.
- ²¹ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 46-7.

¹⁶ Ibid., 35-5 and 46.

¹⁷ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 38 and 54; Winifred Macdonald, *Recollections: A Sketch History of Early Remuera* 1870-1914, Auckland, Milnes, 1983, 5-6.

²² Ibid., 49.



Figure 18: Map showing the Dilworth farm in 1866. Located between Remuera and Great South roads, this portion of the farm was largely laid to pasture with areas of bush. Note the demarcation of the Auckland and Drury Railway line that ran through the property (Davy and McFarland Surveyors from Murray Wilton, The Dilworth Legacy Volume I, 2007).

By 1866, around 30 households had been established in Remuera, many of which were home to some of the most influential and prosperous individuals in the country.²³ By this time, the fledgling settlement of Remuera had two churches (St Mark's Anglican Church (1847) and a Methodist Church (1859)); a highway district board (1863); a number of small Church and private 'dame' schools and several stores.²⁴ In 1873,

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

²³ Ibid., 54.

²⁴ Ibid., 144, 184 and 193; Winifred Macdonald, 1983, 14.

Remuera became a stop on the Auckland-Onehunga railway line. Dilworth continued to develop his farm over the following decades, gradually increasing its size and profitability.²⁵

Subdivision of the Dilworth estate

As one of the first European farmers in Remuera, James Dilworth contributed greatly to the district's early identity, but it was following his death in 1894 that his true legacy would be realised. With no heir and a long-established love of education, he bequeathed the bulk of his estate to the Dilworth Ulster Institute Trust. The trust was instructed to establish an institute (or school) to house and educate boys who lived in straitened circumstances.²⁶ By the end of 1905, the Dilworth homestead had been adapted to provide temporary classrooms and accommodation for the new school.²⁷

Between 1904 and the 1920s, other portions of the Dilworth estate were progressively subdivided and leased by the Dilworth Trust Board.²⁸ The grand residences, which had become characteristic of Remuera's landscape, were accompanied by simple bungalow-style houses and Arts and Crafts residences. One such subdivision was the Remuera Township Extension No. 2, which comprised parts of Allotments 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8, Section 11 and Allotments 1 and 1A, Section 12 of the Suburbs of Auckland.²⁹ Set out in 1907 for the Dilworth Trust Board, the subdivision captured land between Remuera Road (north), Great South Road (south) and Market Road (west) and saw the formation of Omahu, Dromorne, Lillington and Pine (now Platina) roads over the following two decades (refer to **Appendix 1.2.1**).

In 1928, over eight acres of land to the south of the Remuera Township Extension No. 2 (between Great South Road and the railway line) was subdivided. Forming part of Allotment 1, Section 12, the subdivision, which represented the last portion of the Dilworth estate to be subdivided, comprised 32 lots and resulted in the creation of Otahuri Crescent (refer to **Appendix 1.2.2**).³⁰ In 1930, Lot 39 of the subdivision was leased for a term of 21 years to Henry James Butler and it was on that land the subject building was later constructed.³¹

Butler House

Henry ('Harry') James Butler was an Auckland-based solicitor and partner in the legal firm of Butler White & Hanna, which operated an extensive practice in local government law.³² The company later merged with two other firms to become Simpson Grierson, one of New Zealand's largest law firms.³³ Butler was married to Esme Lois Archer and they shared a son, J. A. (Tony) Butler. Whilst little else is known about his private life, the ability to afford building a new home (albeit on leased land) during the Great Depression suggests that his professional endeavours were productive. Few New Zealanders found themselves in such a position during the 1930s.

²⁵ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 46-7.

²⁶ Ibid., 48 and 53; R. C. J. Stone. 'Dilworth, James', Dictionary of New Zealand Biography, first published in 1993. Te Ara – the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, <u>https://teara.govt.nz/en/biographies/2d11/dilworth-james</u> (accessed 7 August 2018).

²⁷ Murray Wilton, *The Dilworth Legacy: The First One Hundred Years of Dilworth School 1906-2006, Volume I*, Auckland, Dilworth Trust Board, 2007, 51 and 61.

²⁸ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 249 and 251.

²⁹ Deeds Plan S60A, LINZ records. Refer to Appendix 1.2.1.

³⁰ DP 21530 and DP 21896, LINZ records. Refer to **Appendix 1.2.2**.

³¹ CT NA513/284, LINZ records. Refer to **Appendix 1.2.3**.

³² 'About Us', 'History', Simpson Grierson website: <u>https://www.simpsongrierson.com/new-zealand-law-firm/history</u> (accessed 8 August 2018).

³³ Ibid., Obituary: Phil Hanna, New Zealand Herald, 30 November 2001,

https://www.nzherald.co.nz/nz/news/article.cfm?c_id=1&objectid=230958 (accessed 8 August 2018).

Following the lease of Lot 39 on Otahuri Crescent, Butler commissioned the practice of well-known architect, Llewellyn (Llew) S. Piper – 'Piper and Brooker' (refer to **Appendix 2**) – to design a residence for him and his family. Drawn up in 1931, 'Butler House' was designed as a single-storey brick residence with hints of the Arts and Crafts style. Orientated to the northwest, the building followed a roughly linear plan with two principal projecting bays and aymmetrical porch. The steep-pitched roof was covered in clay tiles and a large brick chimney extended from the southwest elevation. Accommodation comprised a hall, living room, dining room, kitchen, study, two bedrooms, sleeping porch, bathroom and laundry, and key features included Australian jarrah floors, timber wall panelling, leaded-light internal doors and a decorative fireplace.³⁴ The architects also designed a modest timber garage with concrete base and hipped tile roof, which was erected in the site's southern corner.



Figure 19: Butler House as featured in the debut of *Building Today* magazine (from 'A portrait of modern New Zealand homes', *Building Today*, Oct-Dec 1936, 24-6).

A period of architectural change

By the time Butler House was built in the early-1930s, the Arts and Crafts movement had long inspired the design of Remuera homes. During the 1910s and 1920s, it became one of the foremost influences on the suburb's residential architecture. Characterised by clarity of form and structure, steep-pitched roofs, asymmetry and craftsmanship, the Arts and Crafts residence represented a shift from the ornate Victorian and Edwardian villas to a simpler, less cluttered approach to domestic design and living. Initially adopted for the design of large-scale residences that reflected the status and prosperity of their owners, the style was adapted by architects to create a unique form of New Zealand (albeit British-derived) architecture. Notable architects such as Bamford and Pierce, Roy Keith Binney, Gerald E. Jones, Gummer and Ford, Smith and Mullions, and James Walter Chapman-Taylor were all keen followers of the movement and made important contributions to Remuera's (and Auckland's) built landscape during the early decades of the twentieth century.³⁵

By the 1930s, the influence of the Arts and Crafts movement (although slowing) was also being expressed in the design of more modest dwellings, illustrating the adaptability of the style for less substantial homes. The 1930s also marked a period of change in Remuera's (and Auckland's) built form. While the Crown began to purchase pockets of Remuera land for the construction of state houses, a new architectural

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

 $^{^{34}}$ Refer to **Appendix 2.2**.

³⁵ Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, 2011, 251; Peter Macky and Paul White, *Coolangatta A Homage*, Auckland, Livadia Publishers Limited, 2010, 47-73.

language was emerging. In Otahuri Crescent, was visible in the transition from the Arts and Crafts and Spanish Mission-inspired dwellings to the modernist house. Just a few houses removed from the subject building, W. Robin Simpson's 'Simpson House' (1938-9) was one such residence, having since been considered "the most dramatic and radically modern house of its day."36

Although the design of Butler House, with its brick and tile construction, steep gables and Tudoresque porch, hinted at the Arts and Crafts movement, and to a lesser extent. the English Cottage Revival style, its linear plan, horizontal emphasis and restrained detailing created a more modern appearance, thereby bridging the gap between the stylistic influences of previous decades and a more progressive approach to design. The architect's incorporation of bi-fold doors between the living and dining rooms for example provided the flexibility of open-plan living, a concept that did not become popular until after the Second World War. Such 'modern' propensities may have resulted in Butler House featuring in the debut issue of 'Building Today' in 1936 (five years after its design). The article was entitled 'A Portfolio of Modern New Zealand Homes'.37

Butler House: Changes and modifications

For over three decades, Henry James Butler and his wife, Esme occupied Butler House. In 1951, the lease of 3 Otahuri Crescent was renewed for a further 21 years.³⁸ Following Esme's death in 1965, the lease was transferred to Henry as the sole survivor. Two years later, Henry passed away and the property was transferred to the Trustees, Executors and Agency Company of New Zealand Limited in 1968.³⁹ The former Butler House was subsequently occupied by a Mrs Gearon.⁴⁰

In 1979, the lease was transferred to Auckland Museum curator, Brian Donald Muir and teacher, Valerie May Muir, both of whom were involved with the establishment of the Waiuku Museum and wrote books about the area's history.⁴¹ The first recorded change carried out by the Muirs occurred in the 1980s with the installation of a swimming pool in the garden (since removed).⁴² This was followed by alterations that involved the extension of the library into the washhouse; the replacement of the dining room casement windows with French doors; and the re-use of these windows in the library.43

In 1991, Valerie Muir, who had become the property's sole leaseholder two years earlier, acquired the freehold from the Dilworth Trust.⁴⁴ The land was subsequently subdivided into two lots consisting of Flat 1 and Flat 2.⁴⁵ Flat 1 comprised the largest part of the original site, which included the former Butler House, while Flat 2 incorporated the southwestern portion of the site, upon which a new two-storey house was constructed. The original garage became part of Flat 2 and, in 1995, a 'new'

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

³⁶ Douglas Lloyd Jenkins, At Home: A Century of New Zealand Design, Auckland, Random House New Zealand, 2004,

^{78. &}lt;sup>37</sup> 'Building Today', A Portfolio of Modern New Zealand Homes, Auckland Branch of the NZ Institute of Architects, Oct-Dec 1936, 24-5 and 27.

CT NA5A/224, LINZ records. Refer to Appendix 1.2.3.

³⁹ CT NA1096/164, LINZ records. Refer to **Appendix 1.2.3**.

⁴⁰ Valerie Muir (present owner), historic heritage place submission, January 2018.

⁴¹ Ibid., CT NA5A/224, LINZ records. Refer to Appendix 1.2.3; Valerie Muir 2018, pers. comm. 18 July.

⁴² 398459 – General Property Document microfilm – 0000-04202919, Auckland Council property records: 3 Otahuri Crescent.

⁴³ Valerie Muir 2018, pers. comm. 18 July

⁴⁴ Ibid.; CT NA87A/52, LINZ records.

⁴⁵ CT NA86C/220 and DP145900, LINZ records

garage was relocated from Torbay and positioned in the northeastern corner of Flat 1.⁴⁶ Around this time, a cross-lease was established at the property.⁴⁷

Further changes were carried out to the former Butler House during the 1990s and 2000s, including the installation of French doors in the main bedroom and construction of deck and the slight repositioning of the kitchen doorway along the hallway.⁴⁸ In 2006, a conservatory was added to the rear elevation to enlarge the kitchen and create an informal dining space. The structure was clad in weatherboards and featured timber joinery and a Butynol roof. Other works involved the utilisation of the library as another bedroom and the creation of an en-suite in part of the original washouse.⁴⁹ In c.2007, a ventilation system was added.

The subject building has been occupied by Mrs Valerie Muir for almost 40 years and remains in residential use as a single home.

⁴⁶ 398459 – General Property Document microfilm – 0000-04350220, Auckland Council property records: 3 Otahuri Crescent; Valerie Muir 2018, pers. comm. 18 July.

⁴⁷ General Property Document consent condition – 0000-00723277, Auckland Council property records: 3 Otahuri Crescent.

⁴⁸ Valerie Muir 2018, pers. comm. 18 July.

⁴⁹ B/2006/19952 – 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera, Auckland Council property records.

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

1.1 Chronological summary

Chronology of ownership, events and changes

The following table provides a chronological summary of known ownership, key events and physical changes associated with the former Butler House, 3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera.

Date	Event/Change
1840s	James Dilworth received a Crown grant of 160 acres between Mount Hobson and Mount St John and subsequently purchased neighbouring land.
1894	The bulk of James Dilworth's estate was bequeathed to the Dilworth Ulster Institute Trust following his death.
1904-20s	During this time the estate was progressively subdivided and leased by the Dilworth Trust Board.
1907	The Remuera Township Extension No. 2 subdivision was drawn up for the Dilworth Trust Board.
1928	Over eight acres of land to the south of the Remuera Township Extension No. 2, which formed part of Allotment 1, Section 12 of the suburbs of Auckland, was subdivided in 32 lots and resulted in the creation of Otahuri Crescent. This represented the last portion of the Dilworth estate to be subdivided.
1930	Lot 39 of the subdivision was leased to solicitor, Henry ('Harry') James Butler for a period of 21 years.
1931	Butler House was designed by the architectural practice Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker.
1936	Butler House featured in the debut issue of 'Building Today' magazine.
1968	The property was transferred to the Trustees, Executors and Agency Company of New Zealand Limited and subsequently occupied by Mrs Grearon.
1979	The lease was transferred to Auckland Museum curator, Brian Donald Muir and teacher, Valerie May Muir.
1981-2	A swimming pool was installed in the garden (and later removed).
1980s	The library was extended into the washhouse; the dining room's window was replaced with French doors and the windows were reused in the library.
1991	Valerie Muir acquired the freehold from the Dilworth Trust. The property was subdivided into two lots – Flat 1 and Flat 2. A new house was built on the southern lot (Flat 2), which also incorporated the original garage.
1995	A 'new' garage was relocated from Torbay and positioned in the northeastern corner of the northern lot (Flat 1). A cross-lease was established at the property.
c.2000s	The door to the kitchen was slightly repositioned along the hallway and the timber panelling reused.
2006	A timber conservatory was added to the rear of the former Butler House to enlarge the kitchen. The library was utilised as a spare bedroom and part of the original washhouse was converted into an en-suite.
c.2007	A ventilation system was added.

1.2 Deeds and Land Information New Zealand (LINZ) records

1.2.1 Deed plan S60A



Figure 20: Deed Plan S60A showing the Remuera Township Extension No. 2, surveyed for the Dilworth Trust Board in 1907. The lots to the south of the subdivision (circled), which formed part of Allotment 1, Section 12, were later subdivided into lots and Otahuri Crescent formed.

1.2.2 Deposit plans

21530



Figure 21: DP 21530 dated 1928 showing part Allotment 1, Section 12, Suburbs of Auckland, an area of land to the south of the Remuera Township Extension No. 2.

21896



Figure 22: DP 21896 dated 1928 showing the same portion of land subdivided into 32 lots (and right of way) around Otahuri Crescent. The subject building was constructed on Lot 39 three years later.

1.2.3 Certificates of title

NA513/284 (1 of 2)

ΝEW ZEALAND Registratic Act, 1924. 513 , folio Deeds Indez. 23A. 350 Vol. Application No. 3884 CERTIFICATE OF TITLE UNDER LAND TRANSFER LIMITED AS TO This Certificate, dated the four teenth day of December . one thousand nine hundred and twenty-eight Witnesseth that under the hand and seal of the District Land Registrar of the Land Registration District of AUCKLAND THE DILWORTH TRUST BOARD . body corporate under the provisions of "The Religious Charitable and Educational Trust Board Incorporation Act 1884* is seised of an estate in fee-simple (subject to such reservations, restrictions, encumbrances, liens, and interests as are notified by m or endorsed hereon, subject also to any existing right of the Crown to take and lay off roads under the provisions of any Act of the General Assembly of New Zealand) in the land hereinafter described, as the same is delineated by the plan hereon bordered ______ reen__, be the several admeasure a little more or less, that is to say : All that parcel of land containing seven acres one rood fifteen perches and one.tenth of * perch more or less situated in the City of Auckland being part of Allotment'l of Section 12 of the Suburba boundaries whereof are mine particularly of auckland. Land Registry Office al Michland shown on a plan depended in under A 21876 Nullianfoluis This Certificate of Title is issued subject to Section 23 of the Land Transfer (Compulsory Seguetration of WTitutos Titles) Act. 1924. Dist. L.k. Order in Council No. 7096 exempting Otahuri Crescent from provisions of Section 117 of the Public Works Act 1908 subject to the condition that no building or rt of a building shall at any time be erected on the land fronting the seid Otahuri Crescent within a distance of 35 feet from the centre line of the shid street. Withuston Dist. L.R. 5 X.No.10276 Cavest by the District Land Registrer. Entered 14th December 1928 at 3p.m. Withuslow Dist. L.; This certificate of title has ceased to be limited as to reels. Entered. 23. 2. 1929 Contenter to Lease Nº 13691 The Vilwerth Last Frand Il aspine At Grathe of fet by plan ing. 21 Juni 21 gai from 23. 1. 29 Induced 20. 2. 29 at 2:25 00 have 1' may The Ortweelly Sured Area: Tac. Ind. 15 George At Gog the of Lot his plan 21 al Terme ale: 2 chains to al 21 years from 31. 1. 29 fueduced " 19. 2 29 CELLED

NA513/284 (2 of 2)

193913 of lease 12691 Maryonic N'Grale Granafes No 238356 of lease 13494 George M'G in Bring Daldy produced off 1929 to Maryonic M'Grath, produced 24/2/1930 M. Grath to at 12.45 wilson at 24 1.28 as K The Dil Mc Grath to He Colorad W Mortgage No senus of less No 13451 of lot 12 p worth n.21896 +1.0 I mat Bourd to secch at poord ; ter 21 years from \$ 101828 producted 25/1/1929 at 10 25. 4/2/14/3 +29 at 12.50 loo. Gene to 13494 of lot be plan 21896 the Delworth Youst Board to George & Geath - term 21 years Lease No 16146 of lot 21 plan 21896 44 Dilworth Youst Board to Ruby Pento from 1/5/1929, produced 21/5/1929 at 2:5. 100 Luca Porter - term 21 years from 5/12/1929 Mostque No 198991 of Jeans 13494 George & Goald produced 19/3/1930 at 11:30. to James George Bennett produced 21/8/ 1929 a 18 C R. Mortgage mily No 204987 of lease 13844 at 2.1 1 .1 R. Ethel Foodd to Walter Edward Lease No 13495 of lot 15 plan 21596 the Selworth . Jourt Beard to Grange the Grant the Grath - ben 21 years Mo Elwain, produced 25/2/1930 at 10-50 from 1/10/1929, produced 21/5/1929at 2.4. arter No. 239948 of Le acine 13497 ateban . . . Elslaget 12 16 Cariation of terms of mortgage Nº 193913 Walklufreduced 19.6. 29 at 2.27 ic how liga gene reserve of lease 16. 13793 I ranges to 231946 of leave 13691 Mayon nichaced E winifred fare qu 4 4 185 64 & Grath to Alexander Maskill Robertson, 40/00 1 12. M. total produced 24/6/ 1929 at 11.50 Lucies are. to gene borged of the addine Inrol Bu Transfer Nº 232 509 of Leave Nº 13151 E mily Ethel Foord to E mily Skline Maples allaster & lee Tranceson 1. 23/4/30 + 2.11 :0 want de foreduced 11. 7. 29 at 11. 1 cc Lease 14 326 of lat Haplan Dilworth Joust BENDER Strek Lease Nº 13147 of Sot 41 plan 21896 Ake Delworth 1301 14 183 31/4/1930 Williams - to SY Arush Board to Emily Ethel Ford, Sorm produced 28/ 1/19 10 al 2000 21 years from 5 11 28 produced 1. 7. 29 at 160 A-X 1 Acia. 13692 and 13498 bare K'11938 leases Mortgage Vo 199204 of LARGE SALY Eshi Foord to DAS Cyafe 19 10 determined by like te ente d recovery of 19% Entered 14-11-1930 at 10 produced 25/8/1920000 12 500 Katgage 19 21194 of Lace to 14176 This certificate of title has carsed to be a h Worker to Kora maloney produced 4/1/50 itle. Entered 3/. 8. 1929 w at 11.5 00 11 1 And wed 24 1930 1 . C. Weekswand No 19510 0 / 6+39 pl 21801 ĺÒ , B 14 a i 31-10-30 1-11-230 ia. Ko 202454 of lease 13844 waidelsort C "Food to The State And Elh assila Contratante say setintendent produced 19/12/1929 at , No ! 195.0 11:3 Shan ail 20.1 31 al wanteland 6 CELLE 2674 Canalled and new & engine Noubilice

NA631/275 (1 of 8)

and the second sec			
* مد			[Lord and Derdy=4.
	EW ZE	EALAND.	REGISTER
(Prd. 513 . Folio 254	100 6	B	
Reference :	- 29 A		Register-book,
Application No.	6.88	Carlo Sala	Vol. 031 , folio 272.
Order for N/C No. C. 12674			
CERTIFICATE OF	TITLE UN	DER LAND T	BANSFER ACT.
Chis Certificate, dated the ninth	day of		ud nine hundred and thir ty-one
* under the hand and seal of the District Land Regist	ar of the Land Regi	stration District of	AUCKLAND Mitnesseth that
THE DILWORTH TRUST	BOARD .	body corporate under	the provisions of "The Leligious
Charitable and Educational Trust Boar	d Incorporation	Act 1884	
is seised of an estate in fee simple (subject to such rear	vations, restrictions.	encoastrences, liens, and inter	rate as are notified by memorial under written
or endorsed hereon, subject also to any existing right	f the Crown to take	and lay off roads under the p	rovisions of any Act of the General Assembly
of New Zealand) in the land hereinafter described, as t	e same is delineated	by the plan hereon bordered	green , be the several admeasurements
 a little more or less, that is to say : All Himt parcelin 	land containingt	ogether seven scres o	ne rood fifteen perches and one
tenth of a perch more or less altunted 29. 30. 31. 32. 33. 34. 35. 36. 37. 38	1n the City of 39:40,41.4	Auckland being Lote	<u>48</u> 49 50 51 000 52 000 27, 28,
part marked "Right of Woy" on a plan d	posited in the	Land Registry Office	at Auckland as No.21896 and
bring part of Allotment 1 of Section 1	of the Suburt	a of Augkland.	
A 4851 (Cancelled	andunanco	s	
fots215299 land	ma . We sa Fol	222	W. Wiceiamo
Late 376 William	21 Stillet SA For	223	
	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	· All-	agistant Distant Land Registrar.
3 . 3 6300	TI TI	we abovenneed The Dile	orth Trust Board is registered
14 14 24 the 24 the 10/175	at 53 Plan 1996	and interest of	the provisions of Section 23_of
15 23 0 2 31 1 1 3	any a Al	te Long Trinsfer [Comp	ulsory Registration of Titles)_
819 22 0 0 1 25 3 The man	11 C	1,1924.	Lewiceiano
\$19 A - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 -			Ags: L.E.
20 20			6 exempting Ctahuri Crescent
20 3 3 3 3 3 3 Sa Carl 1 30 5	2.9 Realitant	on the provisions of	Section 128 of The Fublic forks
1 0 0 1 0 0 0 10 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	1. A. 3-		o the condition that no building
A star as the of star as	100 ×3 -	- er part of a b	uilding shall at any time be
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	10,1 31	erected o	n the lend fronting the said
	Y and the	3 Otehuri C	rescent within a distance of
	13E /14	35 feet from the c	entre line of the sold street.
S 2 50 50 50 0	15-		l'el viceiano
1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5 1 5	6.0 A 116		4081. L.R.
100 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	a		atrict land hegistrar. Entered
35	18 4	141h December 1928 at	3P.E. Wieciamo
Set and the sources	20 10 5.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
1002 S2 = 4000 - 52 S3W1	nah 1:		plan 21896 The Distorth Trust
Conversion Factors:			ath. Term 21 years from 23rd
2.9721	1-1-4-1-	Jonusr, 1929. Froduce	d 27th February 1929 at 2.25p.m.
WEINIC AREA IS	1.1-		www.ceio.no
THIS REPRODUCTION SON & REDUCED SCALE			Asst. 1.R.
THE ATTACK THE CON OF THE 20	ege Eur		ABRING 1197 Managerie McGroth
The start and the start start in the start i	10	William Crush Daidy	Pigqueed 190 109:92) at 2.10
LALR CANC	ELLED.	O and	Asst. L.R.s.
		6 Se .:	

# NA631/275 (2 of 8)

,	CANCELLED.	6.31/275
	Roard to George EcGrath term 21 years from ist Eny	i Find along the Silkorth Funt
	" . Were Produced Stat Bay 1929 at 2.5p.c.	"Sours 10 Houry Janes Butler. Tern 21 yours from hist
		October 1930, Produced 14th Summer 1933 at 11.430.
	Lucinceis.n	(C21945)
	C. Must. L.K.	Apat. I.A.
	survey to is 271 , strengthe 374 yourse bear in	Fortgate No.212770 (Contributory) of Lease No.14510
	to Jacks veer & Seller Proceedy side by 1109 at	_ Henry Janes butter to Kargaret Cooper Atlen and Harriet
	some filles I have been and	a Sury Allen. Produces 12th Sarch, 173: 02 12-259.6.
	for the soul	1 Louiserono
	Variation of terms of Lortgage So. 193915. Prouveo	were all seas his.
	17th June 192) at 2.270	Transmission No. JOE20 of Mortgage No. 195991 to The
,	ast. L.h.	Public Trustee. Entered 4th November 1931 at 10.208.5.
-	Transfer No. 231940 of Leave No. 13091 Murjurie Ecurath	. Louiceiano
	to Alexander Taskil: hotertuon. Produced 24th June 192	9 Aget. L.R.
	as housein housein	Tranafer No. 200014 of Horizuge No. 19999). The Public
	Aust. L.R.	) _) Trustee to Sileen Ulive Stevens. Produced 4th November
	jence Soll \$847 of Lot 41 plan 21896 The Dilworth Trout	( 1933 at 10.224.E. ( Serviceio
- !	Bears to gaily Ethel Foord. Term 21 years from 5th	Aput. L.S.
	Koyenter 1920. Produced 115h July 1929 at 1 da.t	1. Tartgage Nº 218558 of fease millege
	herneen	is descuded Marhall Lobethen to Jedd Motors
	Augt. L.h.	PISSHARGE und Reptuaturan
	Fiere So, 202757 of Lange Bo. : 36 M Chiry Kines foor	
	to The state autonoes superinteneent. Freese au yth	atter at the
	December . J. 1 46 ist. 324. 41. Loudderow	Stear At 13358 of Los 15 plan 2/196 The
	Cr West. L.R.	Dilworth amar Board to albere
	SINGEFER SO. 235 360 of Leage No.13797 Veorge McGrath to	Anthna Sheer tean sugears from
	liggiorie 20Grath. Produced 24th Petruary 1930 at 12.45	1 La December 1938 produced States.
	10 vicean	3 in Adver 22.2.49 Sames interest and for the such of
		101.921 30l. 82. CAN
	Lense Ko. 14170 of Lot 21 plan 218jo The Dilworth Trust	margage 2224726 38 Fegre 28 Pars allen
	Scere to huby Paarl Porter. Term 21 years from 5th	arthan thave to Phase file Side & Land
	December 1929 . Freduced 19th March 1930 at 11.306.E.	Carapanence and produce and
	- W Wiecen	P. Lank
	all Lin	"L'ammuna Mistage Mentipone
	HORLENES SO. 204 JOY OF LEASE RD. 115 14 Artas Zibel	1 No 192013 to The Guardian Sound-
	reers to mitter anothe Southland Houses deth bares.	1. and Secular ben barry en.
	14.18.19.18.18. 2007	· Den Zeahoond and marken - Carle in
	Addt. T.h.	1 - 2114, ad which 3 am
	Tranufer So.233375 of Leave Bo.13797 Macjorie Ecuratio	and the second s
	to Sarah Michelle. Produces oth Lay 1930 at 12.10p.m.	Leave Derstie of Kot 22 frean 21846 The
	My Walesan	Saluranth June Board to Barreis William
	CE 10 Asst. J.h.	Short and Ledna fine Short desin il years
	Earistene No. 205870 of Legen Rock Sund. Hickoria to sinifred sens 1005 Fridaction Say 1930 at 12:17	commencing from 21th beacher 1935 producer
	to entired Jace 10 13 And take 1930 at 12.17	Keystern git when got it is a full the state
		A CALLED
	Augt. L.R.	Theoreman of 22 9181. of Lease Merzy eg. Sources
	Cortered Bo. 207963 of Laura Bo. 14176 Ruby Peurl Portes	
	to Kiles Frances DIBOFIARGECCE 23rd July 1930 at	Whe bill worth store geo 20 h soluced
	Sitt Will - manual - for the	\$ \$10 file axt a Cum William Mr. Here of
	Lorisice No. 211137 of Leave So. 10175 hits, Pearl Porter	The second way of the states in Contra
.*	and the first strength of the	
	D.8 43	
	Runder there have been	N'S at Billing
	and an	(p has/yp-set)

#### NA631/275 (3 of 8)

″-**3**. Town for the 276414 of Lence No 13797 George Hundecope tickells to bilen Olive Stevens Monto ager als 26 210 8. of Some ste. Me call and collaign sign stic Son State Advances li 202 4 4 preduced 29/10/19th of 2 ill for maniford All Hauation of heard of norlyage the 212776 a produced 13 82-180 Copy of Stal AJJ KR K 20386 Contractory Harry Cont d Claund Cariation of terms of Horbage 20/2936. produced 16 Sugar 193 Vat 21 from under and g.nuned t. 11. gulland 1000 nffals Law (143.15 " 13118 20 vov. 2.887.43. Alk: * * 7.1 18 25406 bojug of Matensenti of & lauri Allouts 12/ \$ 1937 me 11. 12 a. Dechattgellage Bucherton and Contractors mart gage A22572 of Least pho 197 biller Deve Stevens to How that What Bonk of the Present Str Neport Dagamet *Linic* Cullud Sind gold of the new re 20 aland Limited produti for the gave a soin Krower berry of Internet of blams Contract 000 This Statement OR Leave 17515 Carped let be ula 360 5959. Jukomisel 11.76.4 118.96 eth hours Baned le John George 12.0 10 non Wales - lem 21 years from 11. 1937 - poteduced 10 2-1958 at 1/4 Vortinge 207052 of for the trutes KLSH13 loopy of Matement of blaun under The Wages Bickston and glontrantes John Georg State and south and south Board againg to / 2.20 fran ~ the second ask_ c/ Hatenwet of Elame ... . 1. SIIS ander of the bound of herear affecting These blager Production and Prents ne under have del gig Vi agatery lis Care run 6 and mongages 21119 7 and 28496 17515 hered u/5/19 28 AF 10 Bern Sentende 10-5 good at 2 25 from En 980 Order of the Court of Participant The Derigneore and Leongra Bohs - 121000 Act, 1986 Entered # 17. 35 n: /Ord (deare /3644) C. 19 78 10 Party Product haldet (egan Leave lever) can Nº 17212 of 1 d. U.S. Klow 215.96 dworth - Towell Beach to William prov - Seem 21 space con Leave 18035 flat 52 plan 21826 asting the state of the state o Board to telian elworth / Trust Mortgage MR571357 of town AP 17212, Wed erene rate Jermi Lineard Refer Sumpson & The Schurch of from 24. 10. 1940 produced produced 18. 1. 19. 37 at 2 35 /2 allouier Q.12. 19 the O at 11.15 oc. ++ AC ( louchder CT. somer. Vot. Sto Sel - 228. actil Wontgage de 269.515 Some (y) Elke (A) a formipale and for most page hard 15/6/1939 at 9:30 4 Leave 17515 offat vy plant 2,1876 Vhr stew heat and ~ produced site 21941.at 4.24 Wild et the Yourd Brand to learge In Grath and A aryanic hallerates egCh. Transfer 332314 of Lease 13847 Emily ( the theord to Keith Warne Low llings of anchland Serm 21 years CELLED. "seaving from 27. 1939 pre de ce 1 . 6 18 11 217 1951 - materia a trictural engineer produced 2. 4. 100 at 11-40 in i Duninga (1005/67) . 

#### NA631/275 (4 of 8)

JANULLL. Thanker 342162 of frank 11:15 Stange Lease isi 57 g Lot 51 klan 21 Aur Grather me w Krissally John Lumer 900 net Board to to Percy belling ed 23/12 hight al Alom. 21 years, Ammencing from 1.55, 12 covenant protinced_ 10.2:1941 Lenang A.R. 26 5 1941 at 12 27km Martgage 276016 Juppin of Rease 154150 John Jump Dia CHARGE To the Harver Later Content 27/399 In Bea State odecar In a State 9. Bill freduced 2010/2 mint 1, 10 verth 1941 at 12.2.8 pm BACR 5425.72 of Sence Co. 130 91. ( Lease 18257 ian all Icure fee elle le. etlenandes shackell hover ben morigage 273159 of Leave 18035 Lilian I dluart Carnickael Burton of inicht in. hove Pratt to the Digup to Taut Board produced 19/1/1941. 25-21.43 02 ~ produce & 19.1. 19/12 al. 2700 1.4.16 R4R - Mostgage Mr. 2761.62 Starel , Carmichae. Deelen A. The Bright of iber South . Transfer 337860 of Leave 18257 John Tourner a.L.R Section. malgage 273 540 of the Sec. 18357. John Petta. Lease Nº 18823 of Fot 36 plan 21596 The Delimit Insurance Sough por Stand 10/10/10/12/22 por Just Board to Leon Burton - Lum 21 years." T.R. from 17/4/42. Jonang covenant ford Leave 18480 The Dilworth Trust Board to 623997us John Tumer Harris of lot 50 plan 2/1896 Term martgage 279 21 years commencing from 6/3/1941 produced 6/10/1941 at 12 200's Jeneing Coven 2 at 1. 10. 1949 (Stander £ 1.939 201.247. montgage 274153 of Lease 19080 John Turner Fran Horis torise Deloorth Trut Board produced fars fer 349.5730 15480 Lee. o.hra Pitchenfer Hild Vers 200 ma---ictor Ke f a.L.R. at 11.25 0c Leave 15481 of Lot 27 plan 21896 The. Olevorth Trust Board To Ralph Lander mostage 299840 placest to Ah Sindsanto be formohiming sige Thompson Term 21 years from 12/8/ 19401_ produced 6/10/41 at 12 2500 Kning Covenant al oc 6.11947 2.00 879 Jol 81 Beruwa 40 of lease 18450 Ph a.c.R กัรอีกิสัตร์ arris produced 18545 Cherold Shudd board Lulaci Hallis offatil2 Acan rthi 19HI pladaled arr 211 Los 28 Jean 189.45 of 15.000 21896 v. Ad. 2 939 Folio 247 46 onth and to James. 1.3.1.H.R. Mortgage 2:252.52 and. Sen 1354.5. John. Lurrer HarRISCHABGE Milwerth Goard Produced 11 Jan allunt \$/12 12.5 1991 Scale 18657 2 at Brand Scare 19015 of Lat 43 plan 31896 This Delwater & lin cond of lot 47 cm 4. Board 16 John Turner Harrier. Town 2% 12 from W/1941 hardweed who fees dered 19/12/1941 at 11 32,0 ... 1. Boo Guest Mis 1276 ( funding come and Que cettingle Learning of care or andre County 100 111 A 91 R.
# NA631/275 (5 of 8)

·				5.		
· Le	LE Nº 19040 L	at 26 pear 21296	R. D. livath	Con A junge 28 top	Aleren Tes	Sec 1 6 Sugar
4	I'Brand El	la Yerra Har	is Lenne 21	Sompson 5 Etter	Acres and the state	" New School of
yes	is commencia	ahn Jurnar Haa of from 4/1/1943.	Knung .	soll budget a lower	10 6 92	the lawer-
Gave	mant produ	red 20/4/1943 - KIO	of maria			
. Lea	ackelet 6.9 4	21:1926	solica 7 a.L.R	Junifer Nº 1577999	f. Reason incing	John Termer
Lea	e Nº 19049 4	lat 24 plan 214.96	att convel of	Harris to areton hels	an Grove proce	and 25 12 1943 2
- C.e.	rate water Can	eat 10 711 276 Ile	abworth Junt	at hour		Bellinne .
1200	es de la John Tura	n Harris Torm 21, 420				A CR.
fro	duced 4/sporte	2 20 1106 301.92		Nenie 19096 of Ret	38 plan 218.94 .	with the concentry .
			man_ask_	of burne aler ander Dave	AL TORTO LAS	C.Compred
, X.e	one Nº 19048 of	Kal 30 plan 2046 4	the considerf	I Trust Bened to Joh	n Luner Harr	acum 21 years
		calif KINSTI . The D		hearthe ( + 3 fred	laced 1: 7. 43 at	a store
A.e.	nd to John Ju	ma dans tem	Regard remains			
hease	out to T. assured	11 820 pt 24	80000	" Serve 12097 of Rot.		
				Barenter under Barea		
		estrexio216 The D		Brand to Wilfrest Ru	and a ball of	
		nd Barrele Be		Leme 1. 4. 93 produ Level date 5. issued 1978.	34/233 82	ident sheet
1.500	a frem shele	Jahrenner the	143 al - 2.22 - 1	Contraction and contraction	216	36. 6.6
hearteld	C.T. sound . Y	3 produced 45/	3 Branning	Sand 2 and 5 80		
		Lot 25 plan 21196		21 years from 9/6/		
		Coreal Wyman, Il		3. a. en lunil com ser	A of Sama line	of the sector
		turne Hanie		102 ye. ). Leadeld of seme	III ou Flat LERS	we
1 from	1/1/43 forest	827 Toto 26.	los's france	femal 1912 1 of la	+ tot falan 2180	6 Ste Grand
vide_Cas	1 C.T. Garter Vol	827 7610 26.	G.C.R.	1 Level Band & John	- Jusner Han	id. Jermin 21
		7 of Leave Nº 19040		Yemas sugar glade	& produced sy	171-12-1- 19 5
Han	is to Stanley C	levenes means m	migawhen	Januar S. 199 9/14/14	6 8 237 - 18	Tours ??
_ the	pkuper pro	used 2 /3/13 al 1	1.4.4	Janefer N- 36193	18 S. Le ALON 140.	John
P			abort in	Lumer Harry to J	usten Eres Ci.	Mer Sandais.
		Lat 30 person 1117		produced 2 i wat	Aubrin the	a frances
		C. A. YARNY		·		ALK
		John Summer Me		Case illing of 122/1	in is The Dill	worth Trust
- y		p- 12/ 1/23 frances	ent-b/sfr) al	aver of curse	م . mar محدث المد	Colorador Dear
	tauch in a			Hofus Princed Sky	103_1.1.2.5.c.e. <u>d.</u>	and a second
-lea	of offart	Redilmash J.	and Barras	Central of the seal	Venter Crue it 1	ine Grand
63	ohn Juna	Annie 70	and de			
Hin	strom!	5.+3 Acadera	28.5.22	Linder in 21, 80 of fe	use 44176 hirby i-	a Partie to
Xendola YC 3/25	S.T. round Vol	826 ft 250 al	and all	hizender in 21,80 of fe Leo Bischery Tinkens	ameril Brigg	he de tot
	e	of Servit and and	and a second	Kh mohnie 3537 of		varthington
		moner viel Rand		Harristo Innotico		V first
Lim	tel-produce	d 16643 at 2.39	hopeword	14-11-12.0.00-	Quint .	turfus
1			A.L.R.	11/		- Aller
Jun	afer 12 35971	2 Jat of Leane OC	19015 John	mansfer 36 16x )	Jahn Jammen to	
Luis	ier Manus a	& Bonald Wellion	Rallion	Reaky Solice - Lof Con	we month by	
prov	und 16.6 43		reame	30/9/11/2 01: 3 10.00	A	the word
<b>b</b>			a.R.			a 6.5
Tran	afender F. P.	of Lon 20. 187.1.5	James	100-190 70 286-190	- of lease 190	26 Rules
dine fto	an Quala	E Jakon Turanea	Hagani	Sur DISCHARGE	and of a	
Band	weer 18/0, ford	at the are	- convelant_	La meta dadio da al	n Solgius a. 2	14
•			- ment	Line Pinduc Ja ARGE	di di	Noun
- In mon	efer \$29.8.9.7.	\$ heave 18944	han series	Olease Nº 19177 of tet.	35 plan 21096 2	Laborat
Actor	r.4.Flarence.	Raynence Herestow	10	Tund Ren. d. le John	Tierra Mana.	Jerman 21
Actes a	afely to estrant	+ 10/6/+3 ~ SA	LELLED	years from 9 June 14	4.1. Forming cover	manter of
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	abelote of man Red S	1.1 1.10 1.0	Make Contraction

## NA631/275 (6 of 8)

:	~	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
CANCELLED.	6.	
Conser 10431 of last 23 horan 21896 24.	- 1	Transper N. 379140 of Lease Nº 1803 3 Treston .
believe the Same Bound to John and	ner - j	Esca Charles Sindair to arthur Jamos Frig
Marris - Remail years from 9/4/4.5	1 mar 1 M	produced 25% of wad to an and the start
Barguis La Station of interest	Nº 1	"The A no 394972 of Lange 202 18480 -
7010/15 ( .V. ol SH2 Joeio 140 140	0.1.S.	Transfor BR 319972 of Leave Nº 18450 -
hansfor No 20013.7 of Reace 1. 190 to former		reacher of anokland flerropuic.
Harris to Starley Francis Daniel Hall for		present all 3/ 104 at 12 00 00 -
112 yset Horic habe	B.48_ ]	
morigage + 290042 of Leare M. 19 aut St	may_1	montage no 203539 of Lever 2 1 Storo hairyn
Francis Daniel Backa Rower lines	Sept. 1	Friend boomble, to Cath Secon
Incurrer Space of Station 12 Wat 111	202	me larte snartinet 21/3/ 300 ac 10 21 56
		623552 (Leasehold G. T. iscurd.
Enaber 168.220 John Blancion Serve		25-6-1949 For L'essees Interest ~ Los 6-1949 Leave 16481 Nol 879 Fol SI
1. John under an annant of Care !	N	25-6-1947 Lease 18481 Nol 879 Fols1
- hourse and a to be a fall hall	N. T. J	
Transfer 168781 of leave 19076	inday:	Mortgage 335517 of Lease 13847 Keith Name
Setern to Elkel molet Thellow a pro	ange	Rowlings to D. Coldie & Sons Limited _
. 20 - 12 . 113 - mt 10:31	Mr.	Broduned 16.6. 1969 CATE Mere
	and y	hease 2/55 Juni surveral of hease 13691
Montgrape Sport of server 1915 Douch Will	hun d	of Lot 47 plan 21696 The Ridworth Trust
11 + 1 brab	ana	Doard to Stuart Carmichall Philon
1	118	Jan 21 plan commune from 25. 1.195
Hostings 45 11:38 of read site Paget wer		notway ac. a. Monople cree
Trove & the Union Bunk 231 Michalia fo	milid	arroleyannel Chine
fedneed auf the t 3 pm Curworth	w gan	Leave 20043 in most of the strate of the
2 large france france have	-4,2	2) years been 1/2 1000 - Sectured 36/2/251 de 1960's
Transfer 11 greg and 40.5		Yest - and the
John ilon Genned Areanered downed.	int	De gues from 1/2 1000 - Londward 26/2/2010 and in Leave 22:43 at Bot 21 from 21896 The Silwork
_½. • ·		There is not being the second second
	· eres	from 2 - 12-1930 . Provine 21-2-1951 at 15-35 62
mangage 290 res of Concertors 90	a.so/	5. 30711 Stranghold 1. 1 correct for source without non-outra -1 A L.2 25 10 1951 In Source 25 10 2 600 1010 Note 156.
Burton to the Bouch of freine for the star for	males	
produced 15. C. a. a. 3. a. Bab	A	Theat Brand . S Keen to write howlewing
Thankfor 37.3502 of Plase 3040 Stanly Clare	<u>**</u>	Serve Sigrans conversing for paro I reduce a
" Mesno. Main to Sarah Cligaten Robertson	wite	20/a./ 10 32 at 10 31 20 122
of James Maxwell Roborts in of Unchland. a	ent.	- 20/015: Franktore Creeged
producio 16 - Can 2 30 pm - Cuworth	aufen	Lease 12662 of Lot 39 Plan 21576
		The Delevorth Trust Doard to Henry
The rate 375 150 of hast DIZA Rohm Cherner Antis	10	younes Butter Torm 21 years
Leonard arthur Stinbleff of Such land Salour	ee	commencing from 31. 10 1951
proved in s man Success - to a be	0	Contract 25-11-1953 at 10-28 o'c. Softer watch CT master CR Dantin agt 1 LR
There of a strength for a strength of the stre	Z	Andry 294547 of Sance 1904 general Network
Jump Willand Hackland Assound 14-5 12400	In plan	i have to the second have i have i have
how Willing tackand promited 14-8 13110	and i	indice knowed as a good at as a for
: Thair for 375317 clarah Clinate K. Robertson tol	then .	
" Frainfor 375317 clarad Cligate Robertson vol	<u> </u>	allase 2306? of not at S.M. 2586 the alilavent drust Cours _
La Charte State productory Contra 1944 10 10 3	gam.	to Rangaret May Scale. Jerm 21 years
Lotice		
The second states of A. M. San and A. M.	••• •	at 10.12 se reotoreus un Fr

#### NA631/275 (7 of 8)

+ Lat 22 Plan 21896 Transfor bud of hease 2375 to Subacy of Barre Edwards foreduced 15-9-1960 at 12.04 - -0-15714 .. 20 1.1.000.1 the fire Term: 21. peara co ALF. dueced 6-9-1956 2. 27-10-1955. P. Morlange 442057 of Lease 257 CFL derick David yme are 2:340% 2. C. A. I Finilayson finduce D19 79 48 a m. Marlyage 154618 of heart P. T. hutter son 1. 18 985 _ 101 _ 1. 4454 . 3 45. 1. De See . 1 - 20 3.3 Stand 20018 Levent. Syping Company Climber to active sejulato at 1. 54 % Varahin of Terms of Martgage 156610_ produced 6.7.1956 of 10.30 Gen a con mill Lease 27797 of tot 411 Man 219.96 in reveal of Jease 24698 of Lot 40 scanson tilates Thefilt den 21 years from 31-2. 1910 ( Serving -3.11. 1938 ( flencing and derived classis) Predated 22.3. 1961 hisper E See parge Concana tone 2 incares deco NEGUEDADE A !!! and recuced classes) fradewice A.A. and 25.11.1733 .26 9.4 C.O.S. Variation of Terms of Marigane 12737 of lense 73687 Produced 6 / 6 1966 at 14.05 of clock. All 10050 25782 of Lot 48 Plan 21896 being a ronowal of Losso 17212, to Dorben Simpson. Torm fre 350702 . of lence 5"78" to Lie Strenger: 21 years commoncing, from 1'8-1959. Till Bennie Office of their Jenin ne Timild Tortuced (roncing and ronowal clauses) produced 27/7/2 REI at 11 19:52 30.10.1959 01 2.5000 Carriage Re 1 unal W hox 19713 of 21 52 DC2158 in revers lof here R. 19:035 to Caren Jecenic relation discord 25782 Williemenca algor Vann 254357.11 mosting maine from 24-10-100 Cercing tomor 11934al 2356 Sclarger V Provland 29-3-1462 at 2:0305 HER Munul Marrie 316.308 of Lease 29713 That sum To the State Advances Corporation of New Zewand be 5435) heard m. produced 5 1 2 - 1/202 202 0'C 3.5.6.2 use 23084 - Cumetad Irangler 634698Atg Bridget annie Fordan mannie waman Praduced 1.3.1960 at 2.230°C. NURSE an state Section at a loter family Rome under The Joint Parts, Homes Ac 1550 on Ower The cence Harmigan Te cence Harmigan Flanningan, his wife in whom the within land in now verted as Joint remarks upped to the said Act. Entered 6-3-1952 of 1100 c Allalighnom Martage 482298 of Lease 23084 to Margaret May plante produced 1.3. 1960 at 2:24 of c ALR. Mialiolow ~ ALR K.39915 Lassonala interest in Lasso 29713 collica Transfer 13923 Land Land West as a Joint panyly hanc what the Joint pamily names Act 1950 on 6.3.1952 and Entorog 29.3.1962 of Austral sincere and Nabel NR. ELEVEL MINIAR. PISCH A HE TO A HE TO A ) ranglor 67:157 A-lever 257:2 to jough with Willow A tuckland, Perperg Reduced 15. 4 1162 et i 22.1 lan athol Jussi 29559 of Sol St Clan 21890 Scherolist details CANCELLED Singing and rewel clauses . It out of the support

#### NA631/275 (8 of 8)

021111 CANCELLED. 541994 5 Leave Z 94784 Transmission of Mortgage 482278 , to .02 EL to the Public Trustee. Entered 14-8-1962 al 11 2200 late. 21-6-185 M and ortgage 516426 of A 14 are. 29889 L 31977 - Let +91:lan State Realand produced to filigeral 10.020 Leave 18037 e Jos 1:10-19621 ang Lose 30685 of let 43 plan 21986 " renewed it Luced 9.7. 1963 at. 12.2 base yors to Donald Charles With Glover and Intel NR Leave 31977 of Lot 41 Plan 21896 - record an glover Tam 21 years com mencing from 6-3-1762 (fencing and renewal cla Leave 18657 # Margaret Scan Elaine res. Jonson Jern: 21 years Lon 1:10 HB2 (Jercing and vinewal clauses) Foduced 77. 1863 Produced 27-9-1962 of 2:10 02. AIR Delugade K. 74, 448 here 30685 at 12 2400 he joint Family Homes Act 19 onald Chantes - Select Int Family Home under changs filt Rowinge ISA 32468 of Lot 36 Plan 21896 his why in enon to the Salvation army Beckerty as soine remarks where is the said her. 25-3-1960 and entered 37-9-1962 at 2-1109 new Zealand the CourserALR iaro. K. Kortgage 425 355 to Sustachien Mentual_ 1. 100 1963 at 1. 540'c Produced Provident chiery Produced 21-12-1950_al_ 20.70%. lease 33326 in renewal of lease 19040 to James quilliain and Ruby Jessie Dalsiell Leave 31990 of 60 41 renewral am Term: of Lean 18545 6 James Embery May Vern 21 years from 21-1-1964 4 Anchorenzy clanses) 21 por from 6 3 1962 (Hencury as Geneing Pents west Tr cla 12 Air Lease 3 1331 of Lot 50 Plan angles, 718955, 21896(un Alexander Ogley bee. to of Lease 18 483) to Mervyn Forederick los Induced 203-1964 at 11.20% In 21 years commencing from 6:3:1962 WEbmille Store (Fencing and renewal classes). Produced H. 4. 2190 Leang (3333 is settled a Tamely House Andy the Joint J. 26-2-1963 at 10-59 0'C itsglind Hon a.t. K borgage 53 31090 to The A 35722 Lease (in renewal of Year 19048) reto Arthur Henry Dallimore (Junior). Term :-Alyears_commercing_ from 174 1964 (fening and renewal clauses) Anduced 6. 10 1924 at 11.1500 Arm NIR Martgage 307335 of Lease A. 35722 to the state Advances Comentation of New Least and 12.8.1962 17, 9:1963 at 12:3:6% Poduced 7.5:1946 at 2.00% Settled as a joint Fe 734 A 3.0723 Lease (in renewal of Lease 18945, Family Houses Act 1950 on Lander THOM hander to Doris Evelyn Stella Edwards Torm-2.2 med and any his wife in who the sub ect to 7-1952 O - 17-5-1903 atiz 160 ALR ALR Jago 498 036 6 Mortgage 544397 of Lease A. 35723 6 Virginia Ronayne. Patuad 37. 1963 of 2.59 Unthem Co Build -0 10-32 % eiety 20-1-1961. ALR In Lack. de. 1 sey front file

The Heritage Studio Ltd.

### NA1096/164 (1 of 2)

of Title Vol. 681 Folio 278 Order for N/C No. \$ 80990 ZEALAND NEW Lease No. 22662 CERTIFICATE OF TITLE UNDER LAND TRANSFER ACT LEASEHOLD This Certificate, dated the fifth January day of ne th usand nine h AUCKLAND. onder the hand and seal of the District Land Registrar of the Land Registration District of. HENRY JANES BUTLER of Auckland, solicitor shold created by the loase particulars of which are set out in the schedule herea oder wrätten (subj state of leas or endorsed hereon; subj and interests as are notified by m rial u to any exis ight of the Crown to take and lay off roads under the provisions of any Act of the Ge eral As mbly of New Ze cated by the plan hereon bordered_green_ be the several adm rements a little n us, that twenty-nine decinal four perches more or less being Lot 39 on Dep sited say: All that pare Plan 21896 SCHEDULE Term of Lease. rs from 31/10/1951 of L Val. 631 22662 The Dilworth Tru 275 a L Order in Council exempting the above 7096 describe land from Section 128 Public Auckland ø City to a building line condition EQUIVALENT METRIC **→**1. AREA IS DIS Зn 1.30 R.62020 under the Joint Parily Hy d ) 39 ī, 0.0.29 chain to A-subss .40 3 ne 5.76

### NA1096/164 (2 of 2)

1096/164 Azra 19% ł ÷ 0283566 70 9 1968 at 1180 % THON (ON A REDUCED SCALE) THE A THUE COPY OF THE STER FOR THE PURPOSES OF 096/164 CERTUI ORIGINAL SFER ACT 1992. AND TRA ull Muir 741101. ana to ld of Auck eric Mui his A.L.R. to Auckland; Savings Bank 741101.2 8 8.3.1979 10.25 0'0 at A.L.R. 6 **.** . -÷,

#### NA5A/224 (1 of 4)



#### NA5A/224 (2 of 4)



#### NA5A/224 (3 of 4)

54/224 REGISTER 137091.2 Transfer of Lase A554297 to Kenneth Mark Blenkarne - 31.5 1973 at 1.41 o'c 321993.1 Lease A554297 is settled under the Joint Pamily Homes Act 1964 on Kenneth Wark Blenkarne for A.L.R. is settled 479360 Mortgage of Lease 4554297 to Australian Mutual Provident'Spitture produced 9.12.1959 at 10.43 of 60 5 abovenamed and Kay Emily Blenkarne his wife - 8.5.1975 at 11.36 o'c 1.1.24 11011 Lease to Ronald DISCHARGE Lease 306 323010.3 Mantease de Lease 306 Western Co-operative puilding for A.1 237511.2 Transfer of 30685 to The George Hayman and Maureen Faye Hayman - 20.7.1973 at 2.30 o'c Kandort Society 54.0 16.5.1975 A.L.R. A.L.R Tor 154392.1 Transmission of Lease 27787 to Ina Easton Moffitt as survivor - 26.2.1974 at 1.140'c. 31090 Lease 505609.1 Transfer Irvin and Ethel to Clarence Wallace 11.3.1976 at 11.16 Elizabeth Irvin 0'C. 304959.3 Mortgage of Fease The National Bank of New - 6.8.1974 at 2 640 944 fon A.L.R. 30685 to and Limited 464409.1 Variation of Mortgage 080558.2 and the 28.11.1977 at 12.07 o'c luf 34 for A.L.R. for A.L.R. 704050 560273.2 Mortgee to Northern whit Building Beliet 24698 - P -68243----6-8-1974 040. -atent 1978 at (entered in error) £., A-LoR. 22 2.42 oc. Mortgage 304959.3 a first Mortgage and Mortgage A568269¹⁴ a second Mortgage -6.8.1974 at 2.08¹⁶ c. .R. 399928.1 Transfer of to Brian Donald Wuir May Muir - 20.3, 1979 Lease 217804 and alerie 0' ° 11.15 o'c at for A.L.R. 296583.1 Transfer of Acase 31090 to William Douglas Rawlings and Betty Jean Rawlings -18.12.1974 at 2.14 o'c 399928.2 DISCHARGED to Auckla 2201/98 G217804 0 1 × 12 Tolahan for A.L.R. B291358.11 A.L.R. 802599.1 Transfer of LeaseA554297 to Kenneth Mark Blenkarne and Kay 080558.1 Transfer of/Lease 24698 to Richard Ashton and Daryl Michele Ashton -Ashton and Dary1 23.12.1974 at 10.25 o'c Emily Blenkarne as tenants common in m 12 in equal shares at 1.44 oc. 4.5.1979 (ge for A.L.R. A Jurgine A Longe 24698 to Ina A 9 M At 10.25 o'c 080558.2 Mortgag May_Wales - 23 496639.2. Transfer of Lease 24698 to Jeffrey Alan Walker and Anne Mary Walker - 22.6.1979 c 1 for A.L.R. at 2.41 o'c REAROS 080558.3 Mortelle Holdings Lighted 24698 to Cedix L.2 of Lease 2469 496639.3 Nortgage/to 441.2 974 at 10.25 o'c 3.1 (n) e. Limited - 22 · (New Zealand) for A.L.R. to R: hard 24698 496639.4 Mortg Ashton - 22.6.1979 at Ashton and p de a 085 2.41 0 05 A.L.R. Register copy for L. S. D. 45, 71, 72

#### NA5A/224 (4 of 4)

58/224 811950.1 Transfer of the share of Anne Mary // Walker in Lease 49099.1 to Jeffrey Alan 981913.4 Transfer of Lease 596373.1 Brian Murray Peet of Auckland flight engineer - 19.8.1981 at 11.220'c Walker - 9:10.1979 at 2.33 o'c  $\mathbf{y}$ Augus A.L.R. 981913.5 Mortgage of Lease 596373.1 to Auckland Savings Bank -- 19.8.1981 at 11.250' 594768.2 Transfer of Leave 30685 to Charles John Trevor Battley and Poter Thomas Compton and Peter Thomas Compton and Gray Mitchell Cameron - 30.1.1980 at 10.15 o'c A.L.R. Juli 981913.6 Mortgage of Lease 596373:1 to Her 594768.3 Mortgage of Lease 30685 to General Co-Operative Sominating Burlding Society -30.1.1980 at 10.15 80 ..... Majesty the Queen 7 19.8.1981 at 11.250'c -A.L.R. Po N X B015391.3 Mortgage of Lease 30685 to A.L.R. Northern United Building Society 11.12.1981 at 10.53 o'c 594769.1 Mortgane Finance Limsted of f asg. \$9685 to Broadlands 190 at 10.15 o'c ease 30685 to 3 B015391.4 Mortgag Broadlands Finandat 10.53 o'c L.R. low zest substitution of 10/10 11:12.1981 Salmer A.L.R. 596373.1_Lease, to Jeffrey Alan Walker Term: 21 years commencing from the 3.11.1979 (fencing and renewal clauses) 4 26.2.1980 at (fencing and 26.2.1980 at B.044234.2 Transfer of Lease 876636.1 renewal clauses) to Patrick Henry Hawkins of Auckland 11-28 o'c tavern proprietor - 17.3.1982 at 10:11 o'c R. 876636.1 Lease of Lot 37 Deposited Plan 21896 to Basil Napier Wilson and May Patricia Wilson for A.L.R. the term of 21 years commencing from the 1.4.1964 B047002.1 ) Cancelled and New CsT issued (fencing and reneval clauses) - 30.3.1981 at 0.N.C.T. Lot 37 Plan 21896 - 51B/540 24.3.1982 ) 9.35 o'c 38 ... 51B/541 M. Croxfeel 39 - .51B/542 - 51B/543 - 51B/544 40 L.R. ę 41 787294.1 Mon ANZ. 42 . - 51B/545 Banking Grad 43 -- 51B/546 8.4.1981 44 51B/547 11 1 66Willio ١, A.L.R. 79/294.1 787294.2 Variation of Mor CANCELLED - 8.4.1981 at 9.00 o'c DUPLICATE DESTROYED ŝ, 938113.1 Transfer of Lease 876636.1 to Lionel Hubert Boustred of Auckland business proprietor and Eileen Isobel Winter Boustred his wife - 5.5.1981 at 5.5.1981 at r. 2.52 oc. oALER 938113.2 Mortgage of Lanse 876656. David William Huger of Eastbleen Has Hughes and Christopher Thomas Hart (jointly) and the Tiple's Bouisa Bin and to Percy Alfred Earley and to Warwick John Cooper in shares -876656.1 to thleen Harper gas Hart uisa Bishop 5.5.1981 at 2.52 de. A.L.R.

### NA22A/1174 (1 of 2)

References Prior C/T 631/275 REGISTER Transfer No. N/C. Order No. . 101152 CERTIFICATE OF TITLE UNDER LAND TRANSFER ACT This Certificate dated the 6th day of April one thousand nine hundred and St under the seal of the District Land Registrar of the Land Registration District of NORTH AUCKLAND ad Seventy-Two WITNESSETH that THE DILWORTH TRUST BOARD ed of an estate in fee-simple (subject to such d interests as are notified by is sei on) in the land herei nafter described, delin written or endo ed he with bold bl veral admeasurements a little more or less, that is to say: All that parcel of land containing be the se 13.4 Perches more or less being Lot 53 on Deposited Plan 21896 and being part of Allotment 1 of Section 12 of the Suburbs of Auckland. METRIC AREA 1 Conversion Factors: 1 Acre = 4046m² 1 Perch = 25.29m² Assistant Land Registrar 101152 1 Link = .2012 metres Building Line restriction in Order in Council 7096. Auckland 0 City ts X102 Reg CRE C.085848.1 Transfer to The Dilworth OTAHURI Board - 22.12.1989 at 12.150'c. KON Land covenant in Transfer C.08584 ită). Scale: 1 inch=80 Links ø ٧L L. & D. 69, 71, 72

#### NA22A/1174 (2 of 2)



#### NA51B/542 (1 of 2)



### NA51B/542 (2 of 2)

,

C.271353.1 Mortgage 02 Wational Bank of Nav 220 5.6.1991 at 12307 0 0 ase 217904 to The etand Limited -Da A.L.R. al. 0 C.282826.2 Transfer to Valerie Mary Muir of Auckland teacher - 9.7.1991 at 2.57 of GA.L.R. Fencing covenant in Transfer C.282826.2 A.R. C.282826.3 ) Cancelled and new amalgamated O.N.C.T. ) C.T. issued: 9.7.1991 ) 87A/52 A.L. CANCELLED DUPLICATE DESTROYED

1

2;

The Heritage Studio Ltd.

### NA86C/220 (1 of 4)



### COMPOSITE COMPUTER REGISTER UNDER LAND TRANSFER ACT 1952



His	torica	I Search	і Сору
-----	--------	----------	--------

Identifier Land Registration Date Issued	District	NA86C/220 North Auckland 09 July 1991		
Prior References NA87A/52				
Estate	Fee Sim	ple - 1/2 share		
Area	744 squ	are metres more or less		
Legal Description	Lot 39 I	Deposited Plan 21896		
Original Proprieto Valerie Mary Muir	rs			
Estate	Leaseho	Id	Instrument	L C282826.4
			Term	999 years commencing on the 1st June 1991
Legal Description	Flat 1 D	eposited Plan 145900		
Original Proprieto Valerie Mary Muir	rs			
Estate	Fee Sim	ple - 1/16 share		
Area	338 squ	are metres more or less		
Legal Description	Lot 53 I	Deposited Plan 21896		
Original Proprieto Valerie Mary Muir	irs			
Interests				
7096 Order in Coun	cil impos	ing Building Line Restriction (	Affects Fee Simple)	
Land Covenant in T	ransfer C	08548.1(affects part) (Affects	Fee Simple)	
Fencing Covenant in	n Transfe	r C282826.2 - 9.7.1991 at 2.57	pm (Affects Fee Sin	nple)
Land Covenant in L	ease C28	2826.4 - 9.7.1991 at 2.57 pm (/	Affects Fee Simple)	
		P 145900 Term 999 years com 1 at 2.57 pm (Affects Fee Simp		une 1991 Composite CT
		d Garage 2 Plan 147743 Term 91 at 12.27 pm (Affects Fee Sir		ing on the 1.6.1991 Composite CT
Land Covenant in L	ease C32	6296.1 - 25.11.1991 at 12.27 p	m (Affects Fee Simp	ele)

Transaction Id Client Reference aboyer001 Historical Search Copy Dated 9/08/18 1:21 pm, Page 1 of 4

### NA86C/220 (2 of 4)

Identifier NA86C/220

	and the second second	and the second sec
•	-2 References Price C/T 87A/52 Transfer No. NC. Order No. Lease No. C. 282826.4	REGISTER Land and Directs 69
	CERTIFICATE OF TITLE UN	DER LAND TRANSFER ACT
		2
	Chis Cettificate dated the 9th day of July under the seal of the District Land Registrar of the Land Rej	one thousand nine hundred and ninety one gistration District of NORTH AUCKLAND
	WITNESSETH that VALERIE MARY MUIR of Auckland as to an undivided one-half share	teacher is seimed of an estate in fee simple
	Reason-co-tar-anceneran-hardware (subject to such reservations, memorial underwritten or endorsed hereon) is the land bereinafte be the several admeasurements a little more or less, that is to metres more or less being Lot 39 Deposited PLA	say: All that parcel of land containing 744 square
	12 Suburbs of Auckland AND THIS CERTIFICATE FI	WINES WINESSEN that the aforenamed VALERIE
	MARY MUIR is seised of an estate in fee simple	
	one-sixteenth share in all that parcel of land	
1	being Lot 53 Deposited Plan 21896 and being pe	
	Auckland AND THIS CERTIFICATE PURTHER WITNESSE	
	is seised of an estate of leasehold (subject a	
	for the term of 999 years commencing on the 1s	t June 1991 im Flat 1 Deposited Plan 145900
	mituated on the above described land	
· · · · ·		
		and the second s
	Memorials affecting the fee simple estates	Canada and C
	Building Line Restriction in Order in Council 7096	
1	Pencing covenant in Transfer C.282826.2	C.326296.1 Lease of Flat 2 and Garage 2 Plan 147743 to Brett Alan Joseph Needham and Jennifer 9 Ann Nedsham for the term of 999 years commencing
	Land covenant in Transfer C.08548.1 (affects part) and in Lease C.282826.4	on the 1.6.1991 - 25.11.1991 at 12.27 o'c Composite CT issued 88A/25
	Subject to the following leasehold interests: Lease Flat Composite C.T. C.282826.4 I herein	Land covenant in Lease C. 326296.1
	Memorials affecting both gstates:	andrecke.
00	C.282826.5 Mortgage to Multional Bank of New Zealand Limitger 9.4 1991 at 2.52	Memorials affecting both estates:
0	Station Grine	
J	Measurements are Metric	) "
Q,		

Transaction Id: 54692377 Client Reference: aboyer001 Historical Search Copy Dated 9/08/18 1:21 pm, Page 2 of 4

### NA86C/220 (3 of 4)

Identifier NA86C/220



Transaction Id: 54692377 Client Reference: aboyer001 Historical Search Copy Dated 9/08/18 1:21 pm, Page 3 of 4

The Heritage Studio Ltd.

### NA86C/220 (4 of 4)

Identifier NA86C/220



Transaction Id: 54692377 Client Reference: aboyer001 Historical Search Copy Dated 9/08/18 1:21 pm, Page 4 of 4

# 1.3 Historic maps, aerials and photographs

c.1886



Section 12, Suburbs of Auckland that was owned by James Dilworth.





**Figure 25:** (Above) Sheet 4 of a cadastral map of Eden County (Auckland City) in 1892, showing land allotments and subdivisions at that time (Sir George Grey Special Collections, Auckland Libraries, NZ Map 4658).







Figure 27: (Above) Sheet 5 of a nine-part cadastral map of the City of Auckland and the North Shore, compiled and drawn by R. C. Airey. This map shows a portion of Remuera in 1924 (Sir George Grey Special Collections, Auckland Libraries, NZ Map 78).

**Figure 28:** (Left) Close-up of a portion of the above map, showing the initial subdivision of land between Great South Road and the railway line (circled), which was later subdivided and Otahuri Crescent formed.

1924





**Figure 29:** (Above) Sheet 6C of a cadastral map of Auckland City, created 1947-53. This map shows the streets, lots and public buildings in parts of Remuera, Ellerslie and One Tree Hill in 1953 (Sir George Grey Special Collections, Auckland Libraries, NZ Map 3514).

**Figure 30:** (Left) Close-up of a portion of the above map showing Otahuri Crescent and Lot 39 (outlined), present-day 3 Otahuri Crescent.



**Figure 31:** 1940 aerial view showing 3 Otahuri Crescent and Butler House thereon. Note how undeveloped the crescent and neighbouring land was at this time (Auckland Council GeoMaps).

1959



**Figure 32:** 1959 aerial view showing 3 Otahuri Crescent and Butler House thereon. Note how the lots fronting the crescent have been largely developed by this time (Auckland Council GeoMaps).

The Heritage Studio Ltd.





**Figure 33:** (Above) 1968 aerial view of part of Auckland City, over Remuera (Tauranga Aerosurveys, 1968, Sir George Grey Special Collections, Auckland Libraries, NZ Map 6855).

**Figure 34:** (Left) Close-up of above aerial photograph showing part of Otahuri Crescent and Butler House (circled).

1968

### 1980s



**Figure 35:** Valerie Muir and her sons sitting outside the former Butler House shortly after her and her husband bought it in 1979 (courtesy of Valerie Muir).



**Figure 36:** Photograph showing part of the southwest elevation of the former Butler House, following the installation of the swimming pool (in the location of the current neighbouring townhouse) and dining room French doors (courtesy of Valerie Muir).

#### 1.4 Biography: James Dilworth

The following is a biography of James Dilworth from the Dictionary of New Zealand Biography -Te Ara (R. C. J. Stone. 'Dilworth, James', Dictionary of New Zealand Biography, first published in 1993. Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand,

https://teara.govt.nz/en/biographies/2d11/dilworth-james)

# Dilworth, James by R. C. J. Stone

### Biography

James Dilworth, the son of Mary Bell and her husband, John Dilworth, a farmer, was born probably at Donaghmore, County Tyrone, Ireland, on 15 August 1815. After a sound education at the nearby Royal Dungannon School, James worked first on his father's farm and then in an Irish bank.

Probably in 1839 James emigrated to New South Wales, then in 1841 he sailed to New Zealand on the Planter. After a brief period exploring prospects at a number of settlements, this lanky young Irishman settled in Auckland as accountant to the New Zealand Banking Company in Princes Street.

Overdue bills ultimately forced the bank to wind up in 1845. This did not deter Dilworth. Equipped with capital (presumably from his family) he had already turned to land buying. Late in 1842 he had bought six acres of Parnell land on which he put a house, and in 1845 bought nearly 100 acres at Takapuna. In 1844 he had acquired more than 150 acres between Mt St John and Mt Hobson. Setting himself up as a farmer he continued to add to this estate, which became in time the most valuable of all the farms in this vicinity. He also acquired properties in the township and throughout the Auckland province. He was the astutest of land buyers.

In the 1860s Dilworth prospered. With the continued growth of Auckland's population his suburban farm, three miles from town, shot up remarkably in value. He also had two strokes of luck: the outbreak of the New Zealand wars led to valuable commissariat contracts, and the government decision to run the tracks of the trunk railway through his estate put generous compensation money into his pocket. In 1882 his properties were estimated to be worth £81,044. However, this figure does not take into account the 225,000 acres of recently bought Maori land in the upper Thames (Waihou) valley, or the Whaiti-Kuranui block, which Dilworth held in partnership with another Ulsterman, the impetuous Joseph Howard.

This speculation miscarried completely. The Whaiti-Kuranui proprietors, and a four-man syndicate which owned the adjoining Patetere block, in 1882 jointly sold their huge landed estate (just on 600,000 acres) to a London company, the New Zealand Thames Valley Land Company. The incorporation brought no ready cash to the pockets of the indebted New Zealand speculators, however, and, because of deepening rural depression, the company failed to sell its farm allotments. Ultimately the banks foreclosed. By the end of the 1880s Dilworth alone of the seven speculators was not insolvent. Even so, it is estimated that he lost £40,000 or more because of this venture. As an investor in a number of Auckland companies, such as the Auckland Fibre Manufacturing Company, the Thames Valley and Rotorua Railway Company, and the New Zealand Frozen Meat and Storage Company, he suffered losses in other directions as well.

Little is known about Dilworth's private life. He was reserved and left few personal records. On public occasions he merged into the background Cheshire cat-like, leaving speechmaking to others. He was not fond of long explanations. For one who could be gruff and stern he could also be very kind. Loyalty he esteemed: his friends remained true for life. He favoured Irish people as friends, whether they were Catholic or Protestant.

On 12 July 1853 at Otahuhu James Dilworth had married Isabella Hall of Otahuhu. Originally from Ulster, Ireland, she was 24 and he 38. Their marriage was a happy one, although childless. Tradition has it that around 1880 Dilworth built his third and last house on the estate for Isabella. This homestead, although lacking the external impressiveness of most homes of the well-to-do of that era, was a fine spacious house approached through an avenue of shady trees.

Dilworth has an impressive record of public service. He was for 27 years from its opening in 1847 a trustee of the Auckland Savings Bank. As an ardent Anglican of the low church persuasion – he looked askance at 'popish surplices' and excessive ritual – he was a longstanding member of the Diocesan General Trust Board. He served on the Auckland Provincial Council for eight years. Public causes he supported included the kindergarten movement and the YMCA. Education was close to his heart, and he was a member of the Auckland University College council for the last four years of his life.

During his latter years Dilworth suffered from a neurological complaint, perhaps Parkinson's disease. A visitor to the homestead recalled that he shook with 'palsy'. He had a pony carriage made very low and his wife took him driving every day. After giving serious thought to the disposition of his wealth on his death, Dilworth made a will in which the bulk of the estate was bequeathed to the Dilworth Ulster Institute Trust. This was instructed to set up an institute (or school) which would take in and educate boys who were living in straitened circumstances.

James Dilworth died of peritonitis at Remuera on 23 December 1894. His estate was valued at £150,000. Isabella died on 27 February 1910. Dilworth's monument surely is Dilworth School. In less than a century it grew to be one of New Zealand's largest boarding schools.

### External links and sources

More suggestions and sources

Dilworth Trust Archives. Dilworth School, Auckland

Holmes, C. O. 'James Dilworth: some early land dealings'. Auckland--Waikato Historical Journal No 50 (1987): 22--26

Obit. New Zealand Herald. 24 Dec. 1894

Pearce, G. L. A heritage in trust. Auckland, 1986

Stone, R. C. J. James Dilworth. Auckland, 1995

#### How to cite this page:

R. C. J. Stone. 'Dilworth, James', Dictionary of New Zealand Biography, first published in 1993. Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand, https://teara.govt.nz/en/biographies/2d11/dilworth-james (accessed 7 August 2018)

All text licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 New Zealand Licence ( http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/nz/deed.en). Commercial re-use may be allowed on request. All non-text content is subject to specific conditions. © Crown Copyright.

## 1.5 Henry ('Harry') James Butler



**Figure 37:** Photograph of Harry Butler (from 'History' Simpson Grierson website – refer to link in Appendix 1.5.1 below).

James. On JULY Menry (sud enly). at a pr ivate of nospital Otahuri res late 3 een beloved husband ane) 01 Esme Archer late LOIS father Dewey) - and: loved of Butler, Hongkong of TONY) held at Will be St se VICE hurch, Presbyterian David (Saturĸ hyber. Pass, tomorrow funeral then a.m., day aτ Crematorium for Purewa eaving

Figure 38: Death notice for Henry James Butler (Auckland Star, July 1967).

### 1.5.1 Simpson Grierson: 'History'

The history of the legal firm, Simpson Grierson, is set out on the company's website and documents the part Butler White & Hanna played in their early formation. For further details, refer to the slide show found here: https://www.simpsongrierson.com/attachments/HTML/ourhistory-2015.html

# **Appendix 2: Architectural information**

### 2.1 Architect | Architectural practice

Butler House was designed in 1931 by the firm of notable New-Zealand born architect Llew S. Piper and his partner L. E. Brooker. The Auckland-based practice operated from 1928 to 1937 and was responsible for the design of a variety of residential, commercial, community and ecclesiastical projects.

### 2.1.1 Llew S. Piper (1892-1975)

Llewellyn ('LLew'⁵⁰) Stanley Piper was born in Dunedin to Charles Albert and Jamima (nee Johnston) Piper.⁵¹ Educated at Southland Boys' High School, Otago Boys' High School and Otago School of Art, he commenced his career as a draftsman in 1910 working first with McDonald & Dunning, Dunedin and later with J. Charlesworth, Wellington.⁵² Following a threeyear position as draughtsman in charge of the Works Branch of the Defence Department, Piper established his Auckland-based private practice in 1919 and became a member of the New Zealand Institute of Architects (NZIA).⁵³ With offices at 25 Swanson Street, Auckland, Piper's early commissions predominantly involved the design of Auckland residences, together with a number of public, ecclesiastical and commercial including buildings the Morgan Building. Wellington (1922) and Milne & Choyce Department Store (1923). By 1926, Piper had employed L.E. Brooker as a draughtsman.⁵⁴ Two



Figure 39: Llew S. Piper (Business Personalities: Mr. Llew S. Piper, The Commerce Journal, February 15 1936, 14).

years later, Piper announced that he had taken Brooker into partnership, who by this time had also become a member of the NZIA.⁵⁵ The firm, located at the Empire Buildings, 14 Swanson Street, became known as Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker.⁵⁶

Piper continued to operate independently from 1937, and went on to become one of the leading New Zealand-born architects practicing in the country during the midtwentieth century.⁵⁷ Adopting a modern architectural style, his designs became considered as important expressions of progressive ideas and modernity. This was visible in the designs of the avant-garde extension to the Warkworth Town Hall (1937) (designed while still in practice with Brooker), the Newmarket's Auckland Electric Power Board (AEPB) Building (1951), and the Auckland Harbour Bridge Toll Plaza Building (1959).⁵⁸ Piper's Bauhaus-like detailed AEPB building might be one of his greatest professional achievements, winning the NZIA 25 Year Award in 1990.⁵⁹

⁵⁰ Sometimes spelt 'Lew'.

⁵¹ Piper, Llewellyn Stanley, Who's Who in New Zealand and the Western Pacific, 1938, 407; Obituary, Auckland Star, volume LIV, Issue 295, 11 December 1923, 8, Papers Past. ⁵² Piper, Llewellyn Stanley, Who's Who in New Zealand and the Western Pacific, 1938, 407; Business Personalities: Mr.

Llew S. Piper, *The Commerce Journal*, February 15 1936, 14. ⁵³ Ibid.

⁵⁴ Site for building, *New Zealand Herald*, Volume LXIII, Issue 19336, 25 May 1926, 14, Papers Past.

⁵⁵ Page 7 Advertisements Column 3, *New Zealand Herald*, Volume LXV, Issue 19986, 30 June 1928, 7, Papers Past. 56 Ibid.

⁵⁷ Martin Jones, Heritage New Zealand List Entry: Warkworth Town Hall (#7709), 2007.

⁵⁸ Ibid.; 'Former Harbour Bridge Toll Plaza Building', Northcote Point Walk, North Shore City heritage trails, 2002.

⁵⁹ Peter Shaw, A History of New Zealand Architecture, Auckland, Hodder Moa Beckett, 2003 (3rd ed.), 150; Historic bid for Westfield HQ, New Zealand Herald, 18 March 2002, from

https://www.nzherald.co.nz/property/news/article.cfm?c id=8&objectid=189018

Many of Piper's residential commissions, which included single-family homes and flats, featured in Home and Building magazine and a selection of his architectural drawings were exhibited at the Auckland Museum in 1986.⁶⁰





**Figure 40:** (Above) The AEPB Building on the corner of Remuera Road and Nuffield Street, Newmarket, c.1951 (Auckland Electric Power Board Building, corner of Remuera Road and Nuffield Street.,1950s, PH-NEG-C30160, Auckland Museum).

**Figure 41:** (Left) The 1923 Milne & Choyce Building, Queen Street, c.1948 (Façade, Mile & Choyce building, 1945-1966, PH-NEG-SP-4667, Auckland Museum).



**Figure 42:** The Auckland Harbour Bridge Toll Plaza Building, which was finished with bronze windows to withstand the location's salty conditions near the edge of the Waitemata Harbour. The building has been considered a fine example of its era (Home and Building, Vol. 22, No. 3, August 1959, 66, from Sheppard Collection P665L, Auckland University Architecture Archive).

### 2.1.2 Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker

The architectural firm of Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker (also 'Piper and Brooker') operated for just under 10 years between 1928 and 1937 during which time they were involved with a variety of commercial, public and ecclesiastical projects. Their portfolio included the refurbishment, remodelling and design of several Auckland theatres,

⁶⁰ Auckland Council Heritage Unit records.

Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

recreational facilities such as the Te Puke municipal swimming and rest rooms, and the Waverley Hotel. The practice also designed a number of residential houses, but few architectural drawings or photographs have been found to date to establish any stylistic preferences. Refer also to **Appendix 4**.

The following table lists the known projects associated Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker during their time in partnership. The list is not necessarily exhaustive, being largely based on tender notices advertised in newspapers of the time. Whilst some notices include a building name, the majority refer only to the building type and a street or suburb, making it more difficult to make a connection between the notice and a particular building (and if it still exists). It is also apparent that the design of a number of buildings often attributed to Piper were actually undertaken during the time he was in partnership with Brooker.

Date	Name	Location	Туре	Source
1928	Residence	Te Puna, Tauranga	Residential	Papers Past
1928	Premier Drapery Co. premises (collaboration)	Palmerston North	Commercial	Papers Past
1928	Residence (wood)	Mt Eden	Residential	Papers Past
1928	Church Hall (additions)	Unknown	Ecclesiastical	Papers Past
1929	Shops for Blue and White Self Help Ltd. (alterations and additions)	Unknown	Commercial	Papers Past
1929	Hall (wood)	Mt Eden	Community	Papers Past
1929	Residence (wood)	Winstone Avenue, Mt Roskill	Residential	Papers Past
1929	Residence	Ranui Rd, Remuera	Residential	Papers Past
1929	Residence	Remuera	Residential	Papers Past
1929	New Rooms, Mount Eden Presbyterian Church	Mt Eden	Ecclesiastical	Papers Past
1930	Hide Store (brick and concrete)	New Lynn	Commercial	Papers Past
1930	Residence (wood)	Mt Albert	Residential	Papers Past
1930	Te Puke municipal swimming baths and rest room	Te Puke	Recreational	Papers Past
1931	Butler House	3 Otahuri Crescent, Remuera	Residential	PI5, Auckland University Architecture Archive
1931	Residence (brick and wood)	Waiata Ave, Remuera	Residential	Papers Past
1931	Tennis Court	Mt Albert	Recreational	Papers Past
1932	Grandstand, Stanley Street	Auckland CBD	Recreational	Papers Past
1933	Waverley Hotel	Waverley, Taranaki	Hotel	Papers Past
1933	Residence	Ruawai	Residential	Papers Past
1933	Shop and office	Te Puke	Commercial	Papers Past
1934	Carlaw Park Grandstand	Parnell	Recreational	Papers Past
1934	Symonds Street Flats	Auckland CBD	Residential	Papers Past
1934	(Roy) Ellis House	Kaipara Flats	Residential	Papers Past
1934	(Len) McWatt House	Kaipara Flats?	Residential	Papers Past

The Heritage Studio Ltd.

Date	Name	Location	Туре	Source
1935	Star Cinema (former Arcadia Theatre) refurbishment	K Road	Theatre	Papers Past
1936	Residence (wood)	Mission Bay	Residential	Papers Past
1937	Mission Bay Theatre	Mission Bay	Theatre	Papers Past
1937	Delta Theatre, New Lynn remodelling	New Lynn	Theatre	Papers Past
1937	Warkworth Town Hall, alterations and addition	Warkworth	Civic	Papers Past
n.d.	Jones House	Coombes Road, Remuera	Residential	Building Today, Jan-March 1937
n.d.	Hoskins House	Hauraki Road, Takapuna	Residential	Building Today, Jan-March 1937
n.d.	Holmden House	Korau Road, One Tree Hill	Residential	Building Today, Jan-March 1937
n.d.	Kings Theatre	Te Puke	Theatre	PI10, Auckland University Architecture Archive
n.d.	Catholic School	Hastings, Hawkes Bay	Educational	PI10, Auckland University Architecture Archive



Figure 43: The Art Deco-style Berkeley Picture Theatre in Mission Bay (from A Theatre by the Sea, *Home and Building*, Vol. 3, No. 4, August 1939, 33, PI5 Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 44:** At the time of its inception in 1937, the extension to the Warkworth Town Hall was regarded as an expression of progressive ideas. The design is often attributed to Llew S. Piper, but was undertaken when in partnership with L. E. Brooker (from The historic Warkworth Town Hall opens to the public, *Rodney Times,* recorded in <u>Stuff</u>, 7 March 2017).



**Figure 45:** Drawing produced by Piper and Brooker for a Catholic School in Hastings, Hawkes Bay. The building was designed with Spanish Mission influences (PI8, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 46:** Drawing produced by Piper and Brooker of King's Theatre in Te Puke, also designed with Spanish Mission influences (PI8, Auckland University Architecture Archive).

The Heritage Studio Ltd.

# 2.2 Architectural drawings



1931: Block plan

**Figure 47:** Block plan showing the proposed residence and garage at 3 Otahuri Crescent, 1931. The plan shows the architects' names as Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker (PI5, Llew S. Piper Collection, Architecture Archive, University of Auckland Libraries and Learning Services).



**Figure 48:** Architectural drawings showing the plan and elevations of the residence and garage at 3 Otahuri Crescent, 1931. The drawing shows the architects' names as Llew S. Piper and L. E. Brooker (PI5, Llew S. Piper Collection, Architecture Archive, University of Auckland Libraries and Learning Services).


#### 2006: Conservatory addition

**Figure 49:** Site plan showing the subject building and the proposed location of the new conservatory, 2006 (Auckland Council property records).



Figure 50: Floor plan of the former Butler House in 2006, when the conservatory was proposed (Auckland Council property records).



**Figure 51:** South and east elevations of the subject building in 2006, showing the proposed conservatory (Auckland Council property records).



Figure 52: Showing the conservatory added to the rear elevation in 2006 (Auckland Council property records).

# Appendix 3: Photographic record

The following photographs were taken by The Heritage Studio Limited in July 2018.

### Exterior

































# Interior





































# Context











# Appendix 4: Comparative analysis – supplementary information

The following documentation provides supplementary information to section 6.0 of the report by attempting to identify places that can be compared to the former Butler House. The analysis is a broad one, focussing on general comparisons with local buildings that either share similar architectural qualities or were designed by the same architect/architectural firm. Examples shown in this section are based on *known* places within the locality (style) or region (architect) that have assisted in the analysis. It is acknowledged that further targeted research leading to a more comprehensive comparison with other heritage places within a broader geographic context may yield further information.

#### Arts and Crafts in Remuera

The former Butler House appears to have been influenced by the Arts and Crafts style, which abounded in Remuera during the early decades of the twentieth century. As can be seen from the following photographs, they were often large, two-storey architect-designed residences that incorporated a variety of material finishes. Whilst the former Butler House shares some stylistic and physical qualities with these well-known examples, it stands apart as a modest example of the style with a design also influenced by a changing architectural climate.



**Figure 53:** Guisnes Court, the first Auckland residence designed by architect, Roy Keith Binney. The former Butler House, has, on a far more modest scale, a similar linear plan with projecting bays (from Peter Macky and Paul White, *Coolangatta A Homage*, 2010, 50).



**Figure 54:** Wrigley House (Former) designed by notable Arts and Crafts architect, Gerald E. Jones. It was constructed between 1911 and 1912 and features a roughcast and shingle walls and Marseilles tile roof (C. O'Neil, 2011).



**Figure 55:** Designed by architect, Sholto Smith on Upland Road in c.1920, this building has elements of the Arts and Crafts and Tudor Revival styles. The porch of the former Butler House features Tudoresque detailing (from Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, *A Fine Prospect: A History of Remuera, Meadowbank and St Johns,* 2011, 255).

#### The English Cottage Revival style

Whilst some architects stayed true to the Arts and Crafts principles, others adopted an aesthetic more akin to the Garden City/Suburb movement, designing a scaled-down adaptation that became known as the English Cottage style. The 1930s saw the revival of the style, with distinguishing features such as asymmetrical gable roofs with shingle or 'Tudor' surface treatments. Variations of the design were developed with the help of pattern book designers, which enabled builders to reproduce the style for those of more modest means, and often formed part of larger 'estate' or group developments during the 1930s.⁶¹ Despite some similarities in the scale and the use (to varying degrees) of Tudor surface treatments between the former Butler House and these examples, there are key points of variance in their plan and form.



**Figure 56:** Examples of the English Cottage Revival style residences, designed to a bungalow plan. These group form part of the 'Renown Estate' in Balmoral, which was developed during the mid-1930s. They reveal the variety of designs applied, including varying degrees of Tudor surface treatment (Auckland Council, 2013).

⁶¹ Jeremy Salmond, *Old New Zealand Houses,* Auckland, Reed Publishing (NZ) Limited, 1986, 212-18. Historic Heritage Evaluation: Butler House (Former) | Final

#### Piper and Brooker: Known residential examples



**Figure 57:** Residence on Coombes Road, Remuera designed by Piper and Brooker for Raymond C. Jones featuring a timber weatherboard exterior and Marseilles tile roof (Building Today, Vol. 1, No. 2, Jan-March 1937, 26, from Sheppard Collection P665L, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 58:** Residence on Hauraki Road, Takapuna designed by Piper and Brooker for C. P. Hopkins. It appears to share some similarities with the house above (Building Today, Vol. 1, No. 2, Jan-March 1937, 27, Sheppard Collection P665L, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 59:** Modest residence on Korau Road, One Tree Hill designed by Piper and Brooker for Miss D. Holmden featuring exterior weatherboards, brick base and a shingle tile roof (Building Today, Vol. 1, No. 2, Jan-March 1937, 26, Sheppard Collection P665L, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



#### Examples of Llew S. Piper's varied residential designs

**Figure 60:** Proposed residence on Seccombes Road designed by Llew S. Piper for D. M'Carthy, c.1920s, influenced by the Arts and Crafts style. Note the use of a stone base. The roof has now been replaced with corrugated metal and the weatherboards painted white (Piper Collection, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 61:** Sketch plan for residence on Victoria Avenue designed by Llew S. Piper for V. Noton, n.d. with English Cottage Revival influences (Piper Collection, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 62:** Sketch plan of residence on St Andrews Road designed by Llew S. Piper for A. G. Wilson, 1943(?), showing a several renderings of elevations (PI5, Auckland University Architecture Archive).



**Figure 63:** Residence on Withiel Drive, Epsom designed by (office of) Llew S. Piper for Mr McDonald, 1947, which adopts a more modern design. At this time, the Living and Dining rooms are one space, accessed via a long corridor (similar to the former Butler House) (PI5, Auckland University Architecture Archive).

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

# **Primary Sources**

Auckland University Architecture Archive:

Sheppard Collection P665L; PI10; PI5; P18; Piper Collection.

### Deeds and Land Information New Zealand (LINZ):

Certificates of title: NA631/275; NA1096/164; NA5A/224; NA22A/1174; NA51B/542; NA86C/220; NA87A/52.

Deeds Plan S60A.

Deposit plans: 21530; 21896; 145900.

# Secondary Sources

#### Published:

Douglas Lloyd Jenkins, *At Home: A Century of New Zealand Design*, Auckland, Random House New Zealand, 2004.

Jenny Carlyon and Diana Morrow, *A Fine Prospect: A History of Remuera, Meadowbank and St Johns*, Random House, New Zealand, 2011.

Peter Macky and Paul White, *Coolangatta A Homage*, Auckland, Livadia Publishers Limited, 2010.

Peter Shaw, *A History of New Zealand Architecture*, Auckland, Hodder Moa Beckett, 2003 (3rd ed.).

Jeremy Salmond, *Old New Zealand Houses 1800-1940,* Reed Publishing (NZ) Ltd., 1986 (reprinted 2005).

R. C. J. Stone, *From Tamaki-Makau-Rau to Auckland*, Auckland, Auckland University press, 2002.

The Dilworth Legacy: The First One Hundred Years of Dilworth School 1906-2006, Volume I, Auckland, Dilworth Trust Board, 2007

Winifred Macdonald, *Recollections: A Sketch of Early Remuera*, Milnes, Remuera, 1983.

### Magazine and newspaper articles:

'Building Today', *A Portfolio of Modern New Zealand Homes,* Auckland Branch of the NZ Institute of Architects, Oct-Dec 1936.

'The Commerce Journal', Business Personalities: Mr. Llew S. Piper, February 15 1936.

'Who's Who in New Zealand and the Western Pacific', Piper, Llewellyn Stanley, 1938.

#### **Unpublished:**

Auckland Council property records.

Northcote Point Walk, North Shore City heritage trails, 2002.

Remuera Heritage, Remuera Heritage Walk: St Aidans to Mount Hobson, 2006.

#### **Electronic sources:**

Auckland Council GeoMaps, https://geomapspublic.aucklandcouncil.govt.nz/viewer/index.html

Auckland Libraries, Heritage Images, <a href="http://www.aucklandcity.govt.nz/dbtwwpd/heritageimages/">http://www.aucklandcity.govt.nz/dbtwwpd/heritageimages/</a>

Dictionary of New Zealand Biography. Te Ara – the Encyclopedia of New Zealand <u>https://teara.govt.nz/en</u>

Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga, http://www.heritage.org.nz

New Zealand Electronic Text Collection, <a href="http://nzetc.victoria.ac.nz/">http://nzetc.victoria.ac.nz/</a>

NZ Herald, https://www.nzherald.co.nz/

Papers Past, https://paperspast.natlib.govt.nz/

Simpson Grierson, https://www.simpsongrierson.com/

Stuff, https://www.stuff.co.nz/

Tamaki Paenga Hira Auckland War Memorial Museum, <a href="http://www.aucklandmuseum.com/">http://www.aucklandmuseum.com/</a>

Wellington City Heritage, http://wellingtoncityheritage.org.nz/